The Analysis of the Islamic Community Member Engagement Based on Instagram Content Types

Moh Nasuka¹, Tony Wijaya², Anas Hidayat³, Nurul Aini Muhammed⁴

Abstract

This study aims to determine differences in the level of Islamic community member engagement based on Instagram content types, namely photos, videos, and carousels. The results of this research are expected to contribute to social media users, especially Instagram, in determining the most appropriate types of content posts. This study is an ex post facto and uses secondary data from all posts of the most popular smartphone application-based Islamic community accounts in Indonesia, resulting in a total of 18,026 posts. Engagement rate is measured based on the number of likes and comments. Data is collected by documenting secondary data on Instagram. The sampling technique used was purposive sampling with the criteria of prioritizing new posts over old ones, considering that new posts tend to have a higher engagement; thus, the data will be more easily observed. The data analysis technique used is ANOVA. The findings demonstrated that there were notable distinctions in the number of likes and comments between photo posts and video posts, that photo posts had a higher degree of engagement than video posts, and that there were notable distinctions in the number of likes and comments between photo posts and carousel posts. Regarding likes and comments, photo posts receive more than carousel posts, and there is no difference between carousel posts and video posts; carousel posts and video posts receive the same amount of engagement. Based on the findings, it can be suggested that Islamic community managers pay attention to the choice of content type when uploading a post to an Instagram account to get optimal engagement. In addition, posting a single image often elicits more attention or engagement compared to video posts and carousels as well.

Keywords: Digital Marketing; Islamic Community Online Consumer; Social Media Marketing.

¹Universitas Islam Nahdlatul Ulama (UNISNU), Jepara, Indonesia.
²Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta (UNY), Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
³Universitas Islam Indonesia (UII), Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
⁴University Sains Islam Malaysia, Malaysia
Email: mohnasuka@unisnu.ac.id
INTRODUCTION

The proliferation of the internet in Indonesia fosters the development and advancement of using digital media for communication and many other purposes. In 2018, statistics from the Ministry of Communication and Information of the Republic of Indonesia revealed that 143 million individuals, or 54 percent of Indonesia’s total population of 265 million, were internet users (https://www.kominfo.go.id). According to a study conducted by UNESCO, 4 out of 10 Indonesians use social media regularly (www.kominfo.go.id). The advancement of communication technology has greatly facilitated communication and everyday activities (Hassan et al., 2016). Based on the We Are Social report, the number of active social media users in Indonesia was 191 million in January 2022. This number has increased by 12.35% compared to the previous year, which was 170 million people. Looking at the trend, the number of social media users in Indonesia continues to increase yearly. Indonesia has the fourth largest number of Instagram users in the world, namely 89.15 million. The usage of social media in marketing is also prevalent (Ting et al., 2015; Gümüs, 2017).

Currently, the act of purchasing goods or services on the internet is often referred to as e-commerce, which stands for electronic commerce. E-commerce refers to commercial transactions, including selling, marketing, distributing, and purchasing products and services over electronic systems like the internet or other networks. In order to obtain a competitive edge over their rivals, business enterprises need an excellent e-commerce platform (Kuncoro et al., 2023). The people of Indonesia are in favor of the growth of e-commerce. With its demographic advantage, Indonesia has the potential to grow and advance, particularly in the business sector, dominated by the millennial generation and younger workers.

Businesses use a range of information technology supports and strategies to become market leaders, meeting customer wants by offering a range of customized options. Students are one group that companies compete with to become market leaders. The drawback of students, who are more frequently referred to as agents of change, is that their perspective toward becoming customers or e-commerce users cannot be used as a reference and developed continually and sustainably. Students are one of the youthful demographics targeted to become a target market (Kuncoro et al., 2023).
The growth of social media, particularly digital marketing strategies, has an impact on business development. The primary advocate of the idea of involvement was also identified as social media, which has emerged as a brand-new phenomenon in marketing. In order to create deeper and more meaningful relationships with their customers, businesses are currently attempting to actively engage consumers with their corporate brands or products using social media (Kotler & Armstrong, 2018).

Practitioners and marketing scholars have recently become interested in the idea of engagement. Consumer engagement is an important issue in social media and marketing (Lim & Rasul, 2022). According to van Doorn et al. (2010), customer engagement is a manifestation of consumer behavior that takes the form of actions that are either good or unfavorable toward a brand or business aside from those that are motivated by a desire to make a purchase. It reflects the modern environment, where consumers are required not only to purchase or consume a good or service but also to have an emotionally satisfying personal experience in order to touch, impress, and always be remembered. The availability of social media as a platform for interaction and communication also supports the development of personal relationships between consumers and brands. Customer engagement takes on a more defined form in social media marketing. Howe et al. (1994) provided examples of various manifestations in the form of comments, likes, active users, application or widget usage, and the frequency of usage activities (how frequently members alter their profiles, biodata, and links). It is simpler for marketers to assess their marketing efforts with this type of manifestation.

Instagram is a social networking platform that the people of Indonesia utilize quite a bit today. The four most popular social media platforms are Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, and Snapchat (Alhabash & Ma, 2017). The role of Instagram social media as a marketing tool in Indonesia has been studied by several researchers (Aji et al., 2020; Renwarin, 2021; Wahid & Gunarto, 2022). Instagram solely offers post services in the form of images, videos, and carousels, in contrast to other forms of social networking. But among other social media, Instagram has emerged as the most popular one among young people due to its simplicity and usability (Salomon, 2013). Like Twitter, Instagram has a following-follower system. Every Instagram user has access to the posts of other users they
have previously followed. The home feed displays followed posts in a specific order determined by the Instagram algorithm.

In order to communicate with customers, marketers must take into account the fundamental decision of what kind of social media material to upload. In general, practitioners can use a study of various social media content as a guide when deciding what kind of content to submit. The types of social media material have been the subject of studies by some researchers, including Bakhshi et al. (2014), Lothia et al. (2003), Pletikosa Cvijikj and Michahelles (2013), Sabate et al. (2014), and Trefzger et al. (2016), who concentrated their attention on the Facebook platform. As Instagram emerged as the preferred social media network for teen users, Facebook users started to depart the platform (Salomon, 2013). Instagram has a structure and system utterly different from Facebook, despite having a form of content almost identical to Facebook. The lack of sharing facilities and the incapacity to post status changes, together with distinct algorithms, communities, and buddy systems, distinguish the two social media platforms. These elements serve as a benchmark for the significance of an in-depth investigation of the Instagram platform.

Instagram has been used for social media marketing purposes in a variety of marketing campaigns, including those for start-up businesses, political campaigns, and restaurant brands (Muñoz & Towner, 2017; Salleh, 2014; Virtanen et al., 2017). Social media has an active role in forming and developing communities. The role of social media in communities has been proven by several studies (Du Plessis, 2017; Kaur, 2017; Kim & Ahmad, 2013). Social media also has a close relationship in forming ties within the community (Gummerus et al., 2012; Haworth et al., 2015). In this digital age, it is critical to establish connections throughout social communities through social media. Social media has developed into a potent tool for establishing connections between people and creating communities. Social media enables interaction, idea sharing, and discussion among community members on topics that are important to them. As a result, involvement and active participation in the community may rise (Kaplan & Haenlein, 2010). Social media also makes it easier for community members to create strong networks with one another (Ellison et al., 2011).

Research and studies on member engagement in religious community communities are rarely conducted. Several studies discuss the importance of
The Analysis of the Islamic Community Member Engagement Based on Instagram ......

social media for Islamic communities (Blaker, 2016; Islam, 2019; Syafril & Hadziq, 2021). Social media contributes to representing Islam (Hashmi et al., 2021) and is a research opportunity. This research examines consumer engagement in their position as Islamic community members or social media users. Empirically, prior studies have not been shown to be a reliable source for community managers to efficiently employ Instagram content types (photos, carousels, or videos), particularly in boosting acceptable social community members interaction. In accordance with the notion of vividness, which postulates variations in the amount of stimulation ability based on the five senses (De Vries et al., 2012), the platform employed in earlier experiments is distinct from Instagram. In particular, the research looked at disparities in interaction levels based on Instagram content formats, including photo and video posts, photo and carousel posts, and smartphone-based video and carousel posts.

LITERATUR REVIEW

Beyene Fanta and Makina (as cited in Mawadah, 2023) state that an increasing number of people are using their phones to connect to mobile services, boosting the rapid growth of the fintech business. According to GSMA projections, there will be five billion mobile internet users by 2025. As a result, mobile internet use will eventually dominate the e-commerce sector and serve as a remedy for digital advancements and financial technologies.

Indonesia has a large population of internet users, which opens up the potential to grow online businesses. It is anticipated that this number will be used more frequently every year. Due to consumers’ propensity for online transactions—particularly among the tech-savvy millennial generation—will boost the growth of online businesses and disrupt traditional ones (Rokhman & Andiani, 2020).

Well-educated online shoppers, the millennial generation is highly conscious of the degree of security offered by a website or online trading application. Customers can be assured of a certain level of security and privacy when they shop online thanks to features like transaction history that is only accessible to the account owner, verification processes that can only be completed by the account owner, and the ability to block an account if the system finds that two
accounts or addresses are identical. The item variable security statement received a high response rate from respondents, indicating that e-commerce provides a guaranteed security system to encourage consumers to trust and make purchases online (Rokhman & Andiani, 2020).

According to (van Doorn et al., 2010), customer engagement is a manifestation of consumer behavior that takes the form of actions taken in favor of or against a business or brand that are not related to actual purchases and are motivated by some other factor. Customer involvement is currently manifested in a variety of behaviors and goes beyond merely cognitive and affective activity. These actions can take many forms, both online (like or sharing a business’ social media post) and offline (such as organizing a meetup for a certain brand community or recommending a product to a friend). Customer engagement enables businesses to keep their clients buying the goods they are selling. According to (Vivek et al., 2012), customer engagement is the relationship and level of individual participation in business operations or product offerings directly initiated by the business or its clients. This highlights that initiatives to increase consumer interaction include advertising and marketing activities. Thus, the customer base can continue to benefit the firm, and the corporation must actively participate in retaining client involvement through a variety of marketing initiatives. However, it does not rule out the possibility that customer engagement is born from the ability of a product or service to bind its customers so that the customer independently initiates activities related to a brand. In a further study, the customer’s independent activity is called the brand community (Gummerus et al., 2012).

The number of comments, the number of active users, the number of likes, the number of application uses, and the number of activity ratios in an application (such as how many users edit their biodata profiles) are some of the indicators of social media engagement that Dessart (2017) and Howe et al. (1994) provided. Some researchers on social media engagement also use these indicators in their research. In a study on Facebook, Pletikosa Cvijikj and Michahelles (2013) used many metrics, including the number of likes, number of comments, number of shares, and the length of engagement. However, Trefzger et al. (2016) focused only on using the number of likes. On the other hand, Sabate et al. (2014) and De Vries et al. (2012) included both the number of likes and comments in their
research. In their study on websites, Lohtia et al. (2003) use click-through rate (CTR) as a metric to determine the level of engagement. This further strengthens the opinion of Lehmann et al. (2012) that the features provided by the website play a crucial role in determining user engagement on the site.

Instagram is one of the social media with the most limited features compared to other social media. Therefore, the response from users according to the definition of customer engagement is also limited. Bakhshi et al. (2014) explained that there are two indicators to be able to measure engagement on Instagram, namely: 1) likes, which is a secure sign on Instagram that demonstrates that users like content, 2) comments, the number of comments determines that the user is discussing content, then the number of comments can be interpreted as the level (unit of measure) of discussion.

Daft and Lengel (1984) define information richness as the capacity of a media to convey information. The greater the capacity or capability of the medium to transmit information, the larger the amount of potential information that may be delivered. A decrease in the level of information richness in a communication might result in more interpretation by the message recipient. According to Daft and Lengel (1984), media at a certain level of Information richness is used according to the information that needs to be distributed. For example, face-to-face communication is used when a manager wants to explain marketing strategies to his subordinates in detail to avoid misperception about what is conveyed. It can immediately get reciprocity and can be enhanced by the message recipient’s stimulation of both the visual and auditory senses, facilitating a better understanding of the messenger’s intended communication.

According to Steuer (1992) and Yousaf et al. (2021), vividness is a representation of information richness in a media that is defined by formal features. The formal features in question are those that can be captured by the five senses. De Vries et al. (2012) revealed that the level of vividness could be distinguished based on its ability to stimulate several senses. For example, videos have a higher level of vividness than images because videos not only stimulate vision but also hearing. A study conducted by Lothia et al. (2003) revealed that website banners with a higher level of vividness are more useful for gaining engagement on a website. According to the official help page on Instagram, the user can upload several types of posts as follows:
1. Photos

Instagram users can upload photos or images to an Instagram application or site to share with followers. Instagram recommends uploading photos or images of the highest quality (up to 1080 pixels). The minimum size limit for Instagram photos is 320 pixels. If it is less than that, Instagram will increase its size to reach 320 pixels but with lower quality.

2. Carousel

Carousel is a type of content that can be filled with some photo and/or video content. Instagram users can upload more than one photo (or video) to the app or Instagram site to share with followers. The maximum number of photos shared in a single upload is ten photos (or videos).

3. Video

Instagram users can upload videos to the Instagram application or site to be shared with followers. The maximum length of a video is 60 seconds. Videos can be uploaded from mobile storage or recorded directly by the Instagram application.

To increase engagement on social media, especially Instagram, marketing practitioners need to carry out a series of activities to support this. One thing that can be done is to post on an Instagram account. Meanwhile, Instagram has also provided several alternative types of content to be posted, namely photos or images, videos, and carousels. Compared to photos, a video is more vibrant and information-rich because it has more moving visuals and sounds, which are elements that photos do not have. The carousel and photo post types indicate the same level of vividness because they have similar features. However, a carousel allows more information richness because it can hold more information. The video indicates having a higher level of vividness than a carousel because it has more features than a carousel. However, video provides the same information richness as a carousel (De Vries et al., 2012). The hypotheses proposed are:

H1: Video posts have a higher level of engagement than photo posts
H2: Carousel posts have a higher engagement level than a photo post
H3: Video posts have a higher level of engagement than carousel posts
The Analysis of the Islamic Community Member Engagement Based on Instagram ......

RESEARCH METHOD

Ex post facto research with hypothesis testing is what this study is. All of the Instagram posts from the Islamic community served as the study’s subjects. By using the smartphone applications, the Islamic community accounts include @islamidotco, @komunitasliterasiislam, @iqomic, @@quraish.shihab, and @sahabat_islami. The degree of engagement (Y), which will be boiled down to the number of likes (Y1) and comments (Y2), is the dependent variable in this study. This study’s comparison of the images (X1), carousel (X2), and movie (X3) is its independent variable (Cvijikj & Michahelles, 2014). The degree of engagement on the Instagram accounts under examination varies based on how well the manager is able to oversee the account. In order to conduct concurrent research and get broad conclusions from all examined accounts, the value of participation must be taken into consideration. The average value of account engagement serves as the basis for adjustments based on account management capabilities. Likes and comments are two examples of modifiable engagement metrics. The following formula can be used to make adjustments (Cvijikj & Michahelles, 2014; Hoffman & Fodor, 2010):

\[ L = \frac{L_0}{\bar{X}} \times \bar{X} \]

After adjustments, the numbers of likes and comments are L and C. Before adjustments, L0 and C0 represent the number of likes and comments, respectively. It is the average number of comments and likes on an account. On the other hand, it has the lowest average account value regarding comments and likes.

The population of this study is all post accounts that are used as research subjects, a number of 18026 posts. The samples in this study were 937 posts consisting of 391 photo posts, 233 carousel posts, and 313 video posts. Sampling using a purposive sampling method with criteria prioritizing new posts over old ones. Data collection in this study uses documentation techniques. The data in this study were obtained from information that the user can see directly and listed on every post-Instagram. This study uses ANOVA to determine the
Moh Nasuka, et al.

significance of the average difference of all variables. The posthoc test is a further test of ANOVA (Wijaya & Budiman, 2016).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Data Normality Test

Prior to analysis, sample data is checked for homogeneity and normality. The significant values for the variables likes—photo at 0.093, carousel at 0.082, and videos at 0.200—are displayed in the normality test results. Since the significance values for these three variables are higher than 0.05, it can be said that the data are regularly distributed (Wijaya & Budiman, 2016). Each of the three has a significance value in the comments variable: 0.091 for the photo, 0.054 for the carousel, and 0.064 for the video. The three variables’ significance values are more than 0.05, indicating that the data are normal. Every variable in the homogeneity test using the Levene test has a significance value greater than 0.05, indicating that the variance of the data is homogeneous (Wijaya & Budiman, 2016).

Data Analysis

The results of the mean of photo posts, carousels, and videos after data transformation are presented in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content-type</th>
<th>Mean Likes</th>
<th>Mean Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Photo</td>
<td>9.7716</td>
<td>2.0564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carousel</td>
<td>8.6878</td>
<td>1.8638</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video</td>
<td>8.9468</td>
<td>1.8064</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data processed, 2023
The Analysis of the Islamic Community Member Engagement Based on Instagram …

Table 2. Post-Hoc Test Results on the Like Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content-type</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Photo - Video</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photo - Carousel</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video - Carousel</td>
<td>0.112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Data processed, 2023*

Table 3. Post-hoc Test Results on the Comment Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content-type</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Photo - Video</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photo - Carousel</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video - Carousel</td>
<td>0.581</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Data processed, 2023*

Based on the results of the analysis in Tables 1, 2, and 3 can be explained as follows:

1. Photos vs Videos

The average value of 9.7716 for photos and 8.9468 for videos in the variable “likes” are greater, respectively. Given that the established significance value of 0.000 in the hypothesis test is less than 0.05, there are noteworthy differences between the two variables. The average photo value in the comments variable is 2.0564, which is greater than the average video value of 1.8064. Given that the established significance value of 0.000 in the hypothesis test is less than 0.05, there are noteworthy differences between the two variables. The comparison results between the variables for likes and comments indicate that the photo has a higher engagement value than the video.
2. Photos vs Carousel

The average photo value in the variable “likes” is 9.7716, which is higher than the mean value of 8.6878 for the carousel. Given that the established significance value of 0.000 in the hypothesis test is less than 0.05, there are noteworthy differences between the two variables. The average photo value in the comments variable is 2.0564, which is higher than the carousel’s value of 1.8638. It is recognized that a significance value of 0.001 in the hypothesis test is less than 0.05, indicating that the two variables differ significantly from one another. Photo engagement has a higher value than carousel engagement, according to the comparison of the likes and comments factors.

**Video vs Carousel**

In the variable “likes”, the average video value of 8.9468 is greater than the carousel, which has an average value of 8.6878. In the hypothesis test, it is known that a significance value of 0.112 is higher than 0.05, which means there is no significant difference between the two variables. In the comments variable, the average video value is 1.8064, smaller than the carousel, which has a value of 1.8638. In the hypothesis test, a known significance value of 0.581 is greater than 0.05, which means there is no significant difference between the two variables. The results of the comparison of the mean values of the likes variable indicate that the video is more significant than the carousel. Meanwhile, the comments variable shows that the carousel is higher than the video. Hypothesis test results show that the average value of video and carousel engagement on the likes and comments variable does not have a significant difference.

The comparison of the photo and video variables revealed that the photo variable had a higher level of engagement. According to the idea of vividness and other corroborating studies, media that is more vivid can encourage exceptionally quick and straightforward forms of involvement, like single clicks or likes (Cvijikj & Michahelles, 2014; De Vries et al., 2012; Lohtia et al., 2003). In contrast, the vividness of video is higher than that of pictures. However, when it comes to social media, pictures load more quickly and allow users to connect with postings more easily than videos, forcing viewers to watch the entire thing before interacting with the content. In addition, Trefzger et al. (2016) show that photo posts on Facebook generate greater engagement than videos in experiments.
done on the social media platform, supporting this theory in their study.

The results showed that the photo variable had a higher level of engagement than the carousel variable. In the theory of vividness, a carousel post has a higher vividness value than photographs. In previous studies by (Cvijikj & Michahelles, 2014; De Vries et al., 2012; Lohtia et al., 2003) also show that vivid media can increase engagement. The results of a study conducted by Trefzger et al. (2016), who compared single photo posts with more than one photo post on the Facebook site, also stated that more than one photo post gave a higher engagement value than a single photo post. However, in this study, the facts produced were the opposite: a single photo got a greater engagement value than a carousel (more than one photo). However, the results of this study can be accepted when referring to the theory that faster media that makes it easier for users to engage will get more potential engagement value. On Instagram, carousel content types require more time and effort than a swipe to distribute information to users rather than a single photo.

Additionally, the data demonstrated that the comparison of engagement levels for the carousel and video variables was statistically identical. The potential worth of a carousel and a video is equal in the information richness theory. On the other hand, it might be claimed that video includes more features than a carousel and is, therefore, more vivid based on the principle of vividness. In terms of numbers, the ratio is higher than the carousel in the video likes variable. Although the average difference between the two is not statistically significant, the third hypothesis and the theory of vividness are supported by this finding: posts and videos have a higher level of engagement than carousel posts.

Several previous studies have mentioned that the level of vividness in media, particularly video, has no significant effect in increasing the number of comments. Some of these studies include Sabate et al. (2014), which states that video cannot increase the value of comments. Also, De Vries et al. (2012) found that the vividness of the content categories does not have a significant influence on the value of comments. This raises the probability that further research will yield different findings. The findings of this study indicate that the carousel posts on the comments variable value are higher than all video variables.
CONCLUSION

Based on the results of research and discussion, it can be concluded that there are significant differences in the average value of engagement photo posts and video posts in terms of likes and comments. The engagement value of photo posts is higher than video posts in terms of likes and comments. Users can glance at a photo and quickly decide whether they like it. Videos typically require more time and attention. Photos can capture attention faster than videos, which may require the user to click and commit more time. Videos often take longer to load, especially if the user is on a slow internet connection or concerned about data usage. Photos load faster and are less data-intensive. This result also concluded that there was a significant difference in the average value of engagement photo posts and carousel posts in terms of likes and comments. Single photos provide a simple and clear message or visual, making it easy for viewers to quickly grasp the content and decide whether to engage with it. On the other hand, carousels involve multiple images or videos, which may require more time and attention to fully consume and understand the content. The engagement value of a photo post is higher than that of a carousel in terms of likes and comments. The results of the study concluded that there was no significant average value of the engagement of carousel and video posts, both in terms of likes and comments.

Based on the results, managers of Islamic communities may be advised to consider the content they choose to upload to Instagram accounts to maximize interaction. More content uploaded in the form of single photos typically receives a higher level of interaction compared to carousels and video posts. In contrast, the results of video and carousel posts are generally not better than a single photo post, save from the fact that they usually take longer to produce. Managers will be more productive and efficient in their social media communication efforts by publishing the appropriate kind of information and multiplying uploads in the shape of a single photo, particularly on Instagram and Islam. Future scholars can compare the efficacy of different material types using additional techniques, such as experimental techniques. It is anticipated that external variables will be strictly controlled while employing the experimental method.
REFERENCES


The Analysis of the Islamic Community Member Engagement Based on Instagram......


Moh Nasuka, et al.

*Theory and Practice,* 20(2), 122–146. https://doi.org/10.2753/MTP1069-6679200201
