

RICOEUR'S HERMENEUTIC READING ON TARIQ RAMADAN'S THOUGHTS FOR THE FORMULATION OF A TOLERANT ISLAMIC EDUCATIONAL THEOLOGY

Bambang Qomaruzzaman

UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia
bambang.q.anees@uinsgd.ac.id

Busro

UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia
busro@uinsgd.ac.id

Abstract

The survey results on the intolerance of religion teachers in Indonesia signaled the need for the formulation of a more peaceful and tolerant Islamic theological education. This paper reads Ricoeur's hermeneutics on Tariq Ramadan's thoughts in formulating the tolerant Islamic education theology. There are three aspects of theology proposed by Tariq Ramadan, namely (1) educational activities are at the heart of Islamic theology, there is no faith without understanding and no understanding without education; (2) education is oriented to encourage individuals to gain religious experience that bears a commitment to participate in creating justice and social achievement; and (3) religious experience resulted from the education is transformed for the benefit of people through the implementation of education and tolerant dakwah (Islamic teachings).

Keywords: Education, theology, tolerance, hermeneutic, public space.

A. Introduction

Most of the teachers in Indonesia have intolerant and radical tendency which can influence intolerance trend among the youth according to the PPIM (Center for the Study of Islam and Society) UIN Jakarta survey (through Convey Indonesia project) (PPIM, 2018). The survey strengthens the previous one on the decrease of the freedom and the rise of intolerance in Indonesia (Aspinall & Warburton, 2018; Freedom House, 2018; Hadiz, 2017; Liddle & Mujani, 2013; Mietzner, 2018). The survey result gives interruption to the Islamic education conception; moreover, the survey found that Islamism contributes to the opinion and opinion intense-action, intolerance, and radical teachers (PPIM, 2018). In Kuhn theory, this phenomenon can be called an anomaly, which shows the inability of the old Islamic education paradigm to answer the current problem. This anomaly is a prerequisite for the need for a review of the old paradigm, in this case, Islamic education paradigm (Kuhn, 1962).

The survey challenges the validity of the claim that Islam Nusantara has the core trait of a blessing for all of the universe" (*Rahmatan lil 'Alamin*) (Nurhisam & Huda, 2016). Religious intolerance shown by the teachers in PPIM survey shows that *rahmah* is understood as having an attitude of "unwillingness to tolerate followers of other religion to express different ideas or interests" (PPIM, 2018). Infinite *rahmah*, thus, becomes limited by intolerant attitude. In this instance, the survey result provides a new map of Indonesian Islamic understanding that moves away from *rahmah* to *jihad*.

Two consequences of the survey encourage the paper to find the rationale for Islamic Education Theory that can answer

Indonesia's diverse life problem. Amin Abdullah had realized that Islamic teaching and education has some defects. Hence he proposes the need of new content and teaching methodology to bring in the actuality and contextuality in Islamic learning (Abdullah, 1998). Therefore, Islam is viewed as both a set of doctrines as well as a civilization (Madjid, 1992). There are two types of research on religious learning in Indonesia. The first is the study on the existing teaching materials, like that of Lyn Parker's (2016) analysis on the ecological content, Toto Suharto (2017) on the hidden curriculum, and the intolerance content by (Abdallah, 2016; Rohmatin, 2016; Zainiyati, 2016). The second is the need of multiculturalism (Baidhaw, 2007; Nurwanto & Cusack, 2017; Raihani, 2017; Suharto, 2017), assuming that multiculturalism model will enable students from different faiths to share common values and develop social harmony (Zuhdi, 2005). The study proposes the most fundamental praxis in Islamic education: a tolerant Islamic theology.

The base for the theology of an inclusive Islamic education is neither monoreligious nor multireligious specific, but efforts to make religious teachings able to promote Muslims to peacefully and creatively engage in community based on the Islamic theological doctrines (Qomaruzzaman, Al Bustomi, & Busro, 2018). One of them is to consider some of Tariq Ramadan's ideas about *Dar al-Shahadah* and Islamic identity in Europe. Tariq Ramadan in *To be a European Muslim: A Study of Islamic Source in The European Context* (1999) makes the activity of "educating and delivering" as one of the four identities of a Muslim, "Being a Muslim ... must uphold and convey a conception of life based on faith, spirituality, and a fundamental understanding of

moral provisions” (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). On the other hand, Ramadan emphasizes that tolerance is also the basic identity of a Muslim who must participate in justice that is better in the scope of social life (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). The two orientations of Muslim identity are described by March as *“faithful to their constitutional systems, yet insists that this can be done without adopting a diluted, “liberal Islam” in matters of social and personal morality”* (March, 2007). This thought of Tariq Ramadan will be the basis of the formulation of a tolerant Islamic Education theology.

These thoughts of Tariq Ramadan’s reflect the awareness of the necessity of being tolerant in a multicultural society as well as upholding one’s identity as a believer. His thoughts can be the basis of Islamic education of tolerance, and they need to be formulated in three aspects: (1) multiculturalism thoughts in Islam, (2) the construction of theological thoughts of a tolerant Islamic education, and (3) dialectics of Tariq Ramadan’s thoughts and other modern Islamic thoughts. To answer those three problems, this research uses Paul Ricoeur’s hermeneutics: prefiguration, configuration and transfiguration (Haryatmoko, 2000).

B. Configuration of Tariq Ramadhan’s Thought

The theological framework, not the philosophical one is intentionally used to configure Tariq Ramadan educational thoughts based on reasons. *First*, Islamic education philosophical thoughts have been formulated and become one of the subjects at the Tarbiyah Faculty (education faculty in Indonesian Islamic Higher Education), but it turns out that it does not have an effect on the educating behavior of the

teachers. The reason may come from the speculative nature of philosophy and not a categorical imperative. While theology, which links all discourses with faith, encourages a number of teachers to refuse tolerance towards others as in PPIM research. So, the main question of PPIM research stems from the conception of *iman* regarding education. *Second*, theology in Islam is built by two elements namely *tawhid* and *aqidah*. Whilst *tawhid* is “the process of unification of attitudes, then unification of the community and unification of the world in one system, the revelation system” (Hanafi, 2005), *aqidah* is *tawhid* which has been internalized as a belief which ultimately encourages certain behavior to manifest *tawhid* (Hanafi, 2005). It is the *aqidah* that becomes *al-ashl* or ethos for actions that “move a number of people, awake people, and encourage the believers to enter historical dynamics” based on *Tawhid* (Hanafi, 2005).

Theology, in this regard, is understood as a scientific systematization of *tawhid* and *aqidah* in answering the problem of life. Theology in this paper is not only a *discourse or reason concerning God* (Resse, 1980), but also “*theology which does not stop with reflecting on the world, but rather tries to be part of the process through which the world is transformed. It is theology which is open in the protest against trampled human dignity, in the struggle against the plunder of the vast majority of humankind, in liberating love, and in the building of a new, just, and comradely society—to the gift of the Kingdom of God* (SJ, 1990, p. 16). The same goal can be found in Hanafi’s view that theological studies should aim at “revealing the *aqidah* of the Ummah and the ways the Ummah applies it in its overall socio-political strength, and reveals the *aqidah* and

application of those who have done *ta'wil*, understood and applied it," not just "presenting the *aqidah* of various Muslims and polytheists" (Hanafi, 2005). This also became the basic spirit of *Kalam Jadid* formulation, which in the Islamic world was first developed by Sayyid Ahmad Khan, namely to answer the challenges of modernism (Troll, 1978, pp. 30–32).

To put forward the thought of Tariq Ramadan's educational theology, the first two parts of the three Ricoeur hermeneutics stages will be put forward, namely prefiguration and configuration. The prefiguration section will put forward Tariq Ramadan's biography and comments by several parties regarding the thoughts and actions of Tariq Ramadan. The formulation of educational theological thought will be presented in the configuration section. While the third part of Ricoeur's hermeneutics, transfiguration is presented as a discussion of Tariq Ramadan's thoughts.

1. Prefiguration: Tariq Ramadan and His Thoughts

Tariq Ramadan is a prolific writer of books and articles on the reformation of Islam, and the position of Islam within Western society (Kamrava, 2006). His thoughts are widely discussed and are considered as a way out for the contemporary problem of the relations of religions in the midst of globalization (Ar-Rawi, 2005). Ramadan presents himself as a "*smooth talk and gentleman's beard*" figure (Tariq Ramadan, 2003) as well as being a devout Muslim in the modern world which causes "Many in the US and Europe [to] suspect he is a fanatic in academic clothing" (Tariq Ramadan, 2003).

Some accused Ramadhan's thinking of merely repackaging the teachings of the Muslim Brotherhood so that it could be understood by European and American people (Buruma, 2010). Tariq Ramadan does have blood relations with the founder of the Muslim Brotherhood, Hasan Al-Banna. His mother, Wafa al-Banna was the eldest daughter of Hassan al Banna, while her father, Said Ramadhan, was a prominent Muslim Brotherhood figure who had been exiled by Gamal Abdul Nasser from Egypt to Switzerland. His brother, Imam Hani Ramadan, is a scholar who is described as "*a radical bogeyman à la bin Laden or Khomeini* (Kamrava, 2006).

Tariq Ramadan himself was born in Geneva, Switzerland, on August 26, 1962. Tariq Ramadan completed his education as a master in French literature and Ph.D. in Arabic and Islamic studies at the University of Geneva. He also wrote a dissertation Ph.D. about Friedrich Nietzsche, titled Nietzsche as Historian of Philosophy (Tariq Ramadan, 2010b). He also attended Al-Azhar in Egypt and obtained a qualification in seven disciplines. As a Western scholar, he was familiar with the ideas of modernity so he adopted the view that traditional Muslim identity must adapt to the aspects of Western modernity. For the sake of his ideas, he puts forward a number of criticisms of the Islamic Thought tradition so that he was criticized by Arab clerics, Taha Jaber Al-Alwani and Ahmad Ar-Rawi, for destroying the legitimacy of the Islamic Sharia and trying to generate "needless religious sedition" (Al-Alwani, 2005).

Ramadan itself states that his thinking "reappropriate" the universality of Islamic teachings with the latest horizons of thought. From this re-appropriation, he hopes to give birth to "intellectual revolution" in the sense intended by Kant when he

spoke of the “Copernican revolution”(Tariq Ramadan, 2004). All of that is done “to present Muslims with a set of analytical and reasoning tools, (...) inherent in their religious values and traditions, in order to deal successfully with the challenges of modernity (...) This line of reasoning is informed both implicitly and explicitly by the assumption that there is no inherent clash between the values of Islam and those that underlie Western civilization” (Kamrava, 2006).

The re-appropriation by Ramadan was carried out with a critique of Islamic thought which was considered to be a priori so that it was immune to changes in reality. For that, he wrote a number of basic questions in his book, for example in the book, *The Quest for Meaning*, he writes three basic questions such as “What can I know? What should I do? What might I expect?” While in the book *To Be A European Muslim*, he asks questions like “where are we?”, “Who are we?”. This way of thinking is for Judith Butler (Butler, 2009) shows the tendency of Ramadan to use the legacy of Kantian criticism as a basis for renewing Islamic thought. Tempio, calls Ramadan as carrying out the Copernican Revolution on Islamic teachings (Tempio, 2011).

2. The Configuration of Tariq Ramadan Education Thoughts

The thinking of Tariq Ramadan does not directly discuss Islamic education, but almost all of his thoughts make education a topic of discussion. Tariq’s thinking is as stated by Kamrava with regard to Islamic reform and the position of Islam in the midst of Western society. Islamic reform, for Ramadan, must be done because the Muslim community is

experiencing a dilemma of identity between being “Citizen Muslims” or “Muslim citizens.” This choice is dilemmatic, if his identity is “to become a Muslim” then he will make all Islamic law as a guide to his life while ignoring the laws of the country where he lives; on the contrary if his identity is as a citizen, he will have the consequence of neglecting some provisions of Islamic law (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). Ramadan rejects “Muslims must be without Muslims” (Tariq Ramadan, 1999), he also rejects Muslims who does not show loyalty as citizens and citizens of the world. Ramadan then proposes a middle ground in the formulation of Muslim identity among secular identities as well as Muslims who obeys or remains Muslim while being open to secularization and pluralism (Tariq Ramadan, 1999).

For this reason, he redefines the meaning of a Muslim’s identity. Ramadan establishes five elements that establish and develop Muslim identity, namely (1) religious freedom (faith and spirituality), (2) freedom of worship, (3) recognition of human dignity based on protection, (4) freedom to deliver and explain faith and the spirituality possessed, and (5) participation in activities, social, political, economic in the his life space (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). These five elements for Ramadan are essential prerequisites that shape Muslim identity. When these five conditions are available a Muslim has the responsibility to become loyal citizens and be involved in improving the overall situation of society (Tariq Ramadan, 1999).

These five elements of identity are suggested by Ramadan for European countries to pay attention to the basic rights of a Muslim. The five elements are based on Ramadan

analysis that there is a Muslim stigmatized as an unfaithful citizen because he adheres to the teachings obediently, while there are also Muslims who consider his country to be illegitimate because they are not based on Islamic law. For Ramadan, the Islamic state of a country lies in protecting the Muslim and Islam as an identity that must be respected by the state.

Ramadan then formulates 4 elements of a Muslim's identity regardless of Arab or Asian culture, tradition or customs. The four elements are (1) faith, *amaliah*, and spirituality; (2) understanding the text and context, (3) educating and delivering, and (4) acting and participating (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). These four elements are identities that the State must respect for all religions. Whatever the religion, all people must live with their faith and spirituality, refer to the scriptures, internalize the teachings of their faith in the family and convey it to others, then actively participate in reconciling the world.

A country that has appreciated these four Muslim identities for Ramadan can be accepted as *dar al-shahadah*, not *dar al-harb*. *Dar al-shahadah* is the idea of a middle way of Ramadan towards the construction of classical fiqh on the status of the State which was previously divided binary into *dar al-Islam* and *dar al-harb*. A country that is recognized and guarded by a Muslim, in the construction of classical fiqh, is a country that applies Islamic law or *dar al-Salam*. Consequently, *dar al-harb*, a country that does not implement Islamic law does not have to be guarded, and is even allowed to be fought. Yet, on the other hand, as citizens of a state, a Muslim must recognize the legislation and act within the

scope of the applicable law. Therefore, the division of *dar al-Islam* and *dar al-harb* can no longer be used, besides *dar al-Islam* is not absolutely referred to as *dar al-harb*.

Apart from *dar al-Islam*, in the treasures of Islamic thought, actually it can also be called *dar al-'ahd* (treaty area), *dar ad-da'wa*, or in this case, Ramadan proposes the conception of *dar al-shahadah* (proof of truth area). The idea of *al-Shahadah* is based on a Ramadan interpretation of the meaning of two sentences of *Shahadah*. The *Shahadah* for Ramadan is an absolute commitment to the individual's agreement with God that he must obey orders with the provisions of Islamic teachings (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). Simultaneously, based on the Quran's command, "testify (for the truth of their faith) in the presence of humans", a Muslim must prove his *shahadah* before others through action and participation in the public space. Ramadan stated "to declare *Shahadah* means to be involved in society in all fields that need it - unemployment, marginalization, crime, and so on. This also means being involved in a positive reform process ..." (Tariq Ramadan, 1999).

Shahadah for Ramadan must be accounted for on three sides, namely on himself, on his family, and on society. On himself manifested in the form of obedience to keep his *iman*, good deeds, and spirituality based on the principle of justice and love. On the family, a Muslim must teach his religion, and then on the community, a Muslim must show his privilege by participating in spreading *rahmatan li al-'alamin* (Tariq Ramadan, 1999).

a) Tawhid as the Core of Islamic Theology

Theology of Islamic Education is the theological formula for the practice of Islamic education. Ramadan shows the theological orientation of all his thoughts. For example, Ramadan emphasizes that “to understand Islam is to understand the meaning and significance of some dimensions of tawhid” (Tariq Ramadan, 2004). In another section, Ramadan writes that “the first and foremost element of Muslim identity is a faith which is a true sign that someone believes in the substance of the Creator who has no allies” (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). This *iman* is then manifested in *ibadah* (prayer, zakat, fasting, and pilgrimage) and brought to life through spirituality.

Tawhid refers to an absolute unity. Ramadan says that tawhid expresses God as “the first Principle, Creator of all, eternally present in history and at each moment, He is the Highest, beyond all that is, infinitely near, closer to each of us than (our) jugular vein. He is the One, the Only One, the Absolute, Justice, Truth, and Light]” (Tariq Ramadan, 2004). Unlike the *Jahiliyah* belief about God which is completely detached from human life, God in the teachings of tawhid is “The One has forever been accompanying us, His creation, from our beginnings to our end”. This is the very meaning of tawhid (the Oneness of God) and of the Quranic formula that refers to humankind’s destiny as well as to that of each individual: *‘To God, we belong and to Him, we return.’*” (Esack, 2005)

God in *tawhid* is always presented radically, which provides for human needs (Tariq Ramadan, 2004), including the revealed Qur’an and the Prophet. For this reason,

Tawhid emphasizes the importance of reading the Koran and the Sunnah. There is no faith without understanding, and understanding of the Quran is woven through the reading of the text and its context. Muslims, for Ramadan, are asked to “go beyond a restrictive interpretation based on literal faithfulness to text with no consideration to the context and with no sense of priorities”.

The Main Message of Islam is God’s desire that humans be consistent with God’s blessing and grace. Islam means submitting surrender to God, and the goal for a Muslim is to submit to the blessing and grace of God and then freely imitate blessing and grace for life together. The word “Islam” itself is often translated as “submission,” but Ramadan gives the meaning of one’s “peace” and self-giving (Tariq Ramadan, 2009) to God so that he receives Divine Grace and makes that divine Grace his identity.

Ramadan can be referred to as a theologian mainly because all of his thoughts on Islamic reform are based on the core conception of faith in Islamic teachings, namely *shahadah*. Moreover, he wrote a dissertation to get a doctorate in Islamic Studies about the theological thinking of his grandfather, Hassan al-Banna (Carle, 2011). Although he insists that there is no theology in Islam (Tariq Ramadan, 2004), in a context similar to that understood in Christianity. Theology in Islam or Kalam, for Nasr, “continued to be the science that bears the responsibility of solidly establishing religious beliefs by giving proofs and dispelling doubts” (Nasr, 1991).

b) Theology of Education Based on Tawhid

Education for Ramadan is “drawing’ or ‘guiding’ individuals out of themselves so that they can establish a conscious relationship with themselves and their physical and social environment” (T. Ramadan, 2010). Education is related to the meaning of being a human, therefore education becomes a basic right that cannot be revoked and must be guaranteed in all human societies. Self-recognition, in the framework of *tawhid*, means for human consciousness to recognize God, as Ramadan says, “the knowledge of God leads us to our self, as the knowledge of our self leads to God”.

Tawhid in Ramadan’s thinking has two meanings. First, “the concept of *tawhid* expresses first and essentially the fact of the absolute oneness of God: the first Principle, Creator of all, eternally present in history and at each moment. Second, the whole of creation, in its most natural state, is the most immediate expression of the order intended by the Transcendent. While the universe has this “natural faith” (“faith in nature”), humans do not necessarily immediately believe in God. Humans are creatures endowed with awareness and freedom, however they “do not see” and “do not understand” the celebration that the creation, simply by being what it is, addresses to God. Here we must learn to celebrate, learn to pray (T Ramadan, n.d.). Based on that, the introduction of God education is a basic obligation for humans. This is what is meant by Ramadan, “education used to be something of a rite, and there was something ‘sacred’ about followings its stages, which were initiatory rather than critical.”

Education as a sacred activity is still needed by a human, even in today globalized world. Education that is

able “to reconcile itself to the need to teach individuals about spiritualities, religions, philosophies, and art” is needed. Especially because all traditions expect education to produce “individuals may well be audacious, but they remain basically optimistic despite all life’s difficulties and sufferings”, one achievement that arises from the individual who is confident, autonomous, dignified, curious, critical, constructive, creative and caring (T. Ramadan, 2010).

Elsewhere, Ramadan defines education as “acquiring knowledge and skills, but it also means learning to keep our spiritual, intellectual and aesthetic distance (from ourselves, the objects and judgments) (T. Ramadan, 2010). Spirituality remains the main focus of Ramadan in formulating education because the introduction of God is the basis of the meaning of being human. Besides spirituality, Ramadan considers the need of education of liberation which “challenge the substance and purpose of skills, the relationship between school and society, between the universities and civic life, and between knowledge and solidarity” (T. Ramadan, 2010).

In the other book, *A European Muslim*, Ramadan formulates education as a consequence of faith. First, a believer has a responsibility to associate his life with the Quran and Sunnah, because “there is no true faith without understanding”. Becoming a Muslim, for Ramadan, means continuing to increase his capacity, trying his best to be more knowledgeable (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). Second, education as an activity to educate others is a consequence of faith. Ramadan writes, “Faith (*iman*) is a pledge (*amaana*), and Muslims are required to pass this *amana* on to their children and those close to them and, as we have already explained, to bear witness to it before humankind. To be Muslim

entails educating and passing on..." (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). Education, in the sense of educating oneself and family, according to Ramadan, is a consequence of faith. It is on this basis that it can be argued that the thought of Ramadan is a theological thought.

Under the light of this faith, a human being will be led by Islamic spirituality out of the trap of selfishness that defiles the other party. Islam actually tries to open the hearts of Muslims so that they can enter into relationships that are humble and respectful towards others. In "*Priority must be given,*" Ramadan states, "*to achieving this opening up of minds and hearts: to be oneself not in opposition to the Other but alongside him, with him, dealing with our differences in active proximity, not in isolated corners of our intellectual and social ghettos*" (Tariq Ramadan, 2010a).

The purpose of Islamic education for Ramadan is to become a moral person based on a Muslim identity. Ramadan explains, "Muslim morality is entirely based on an awareness of one's responsibility before the Creator and among mankind to be someone who serves others" (Tariq Ramadan, 2010a). To complete the responsibility to serve this, Ramadan formulates humility as the core of Islamic ethics. "Humility," for Ramadan, "is a condition that allows humans to enter into their humanity. Humility is the source of all ethics" (Tariq Ramadan, 2010a). As a faithful Muslim, Ramadan received an understanding of the importance of humility through the Qur'an, which states, "There is no vision that can bring Him in, but He takes all sight" (6: 103). Humans are limited beings, vulnerable to selfish desires and misunderstandings of God and each other. Based on that awareness, humility is the only best ethical choice.

Once again we see the theological significance of God's tawhid. A belief in a single God who is radically present in the world has an ethical component in caring for people in need. The principles described by Ramadan are intended to give "a capacity to anticipate and transform reality in order to harmonize the definitive objectives of ethics and human behavior in history" (Tariq Ramadan, 2008). In other words, Islamic ethics encourages Muslims to see their current reality and change it to be the light of God's tawhid and human tawhid.

On the other hand, Ramadan encourages education to prevent racist and xenophobic aberrations (fear or hatred of people or objects that are foreign) (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). This goal is seen in the history of the Prophet Muhammad, *the Footsteps of the Prophet*, which was carried out by Ramadan. In the book Ramadan does not add new facts to the biography of the Prophet Muhammad but to "to draw lessons from the life of Muhammad for contemporary Muslims" (Tampio, 2011) or in Tampio's observations as an activity "to reinterpret the Prophet's life to draw the proper lessons for contemporary pluralistic societies" with method 'to extract the principles from the Prophet's behavior and argue that their application today—when the supplementary premises needed to arrive at a judgment differ greatly from Muhammad's time and place—may diverge from a literal replication of the Prophet's actions...' (Tampio, 2011). *Sirah Nabawiya* is used by Ramadan as a mirror of the arrangement of a Muslim identity that is capable "to develop solid ties with non-Muslims in the name of kinship or friendship, on the basis of mutual respect and trust, even in perilous situations" (Tariq Ramadan, 2009).

Then what knowledge must be learned? The Muslim identity that Ramadan formulates in addition to the obligation of a Muslim to believe, he or she has to learn to understand the Quran-Sunnah, teach and preach, also encourage participation in the public space. The whole identity requires understanding that encourages people to develop their intelligence “to read the world’s reality, to grasp its meaning and infer its grammar” (Tariq Ramadan, 2008).

The source of knowledge in educational theology, for Ramadan, is all knowledge that exist. Islam is not a religion of one Book, the Quran, but of two Books: The Book of the Qur’an and the Book of the Universe. The Book of the Universe does not refer to a literal book, but to the natural world. The two Books are composed of signs that point to the presence of God (Tariq Ramadan, 2008). Both Books are revelatory gifts from God and they are “not opposed, each of them completes the other, gives it meaning and reaches toward the divine” (Tariq Ramadan, 2008). Ramadan states that “*The Book of the Universe and the social sciences that unfold there open the doors (to) ... human reason*” (Tariq Ramadan, 2008). At this point, the science of religion which refers to the Quran and the general science that refers to nature and the phenomenon of humanity are not distinguished or considered equally important to be studied.

If we refer to the three levels of educational theology that are formulated by Ramadan, namely for self, family/ community, and society, as well as the responsibility to serve humanity, the knowledge that is taught is not just a science of religion. At the individual and group stages,

Islamic sciences must be taught, including the knowledge to understand the Quran in a textual and contextual manner. At the stage of Muslims' roles to participate in society, whatever knowledge that can serve humanity is needed.

The orientation of the Ramadan theology of education which focuses on Muslim identity (which is open, dynamic, and participates with its environment while remaining firmly up to the principle) makes its thinking compatible with tolerance education needs.

3. Transfiguration of Tariq Ramadan Theological Thinking

Tariq Ramadan has developed a thought to adapt Islam into the secular and modern state. He encourages Muslims to engage within and contribute to public spaces without scarifying his/her own beliefs (Ourghi, 2010). This thought is highly regarded in the Islamic discourse on tolerance, especially in Indonesia. A recent research shows that Indonesian Muslims are not tolerant (Azca, Ikhwan, & Arrobi, 2019) especially against non-Muslim public leaders. Hence, it is deemed that religiosity needs to be integrated into democratic values (Mujani, 2019). The needs of the alteration of Islamic education paradigm has been discussed, for example, by Syamsul Ma'arif (2019). He emphasizes that Islamic education institutions such as *pesantren* (Islamic boarding schools) can shift their paradigm to be more of that can accommodate the enhancement of civil and deliberative society by promoting values such as moderation, fairness and recognition of differences. The acceptance of "the other" in public spaces is the multicultural principle whose

implementation in Indonesian education is very valuable (Masamah & Huda, 2016; Miftah, 2016; Saekan, 2017).

To realize Tariq Ramadan's concept, there needs to be a dialogue with other thoughts—either from secular or Islamic scholars. Ramadan's root of thoughts can be traced to Western theorists like Habermas' on the public space as argued by Volker Kaul (Kaul, 2010), and to Islamic theorists like Mohammad Iqbal and Abdurrachman Wahid.

The educational theology of Tariq Ramadan rests on tawhid, namely creed. Ramadan defines *shahadah* as a proof (activity shows evidence of certain truths) and a testimony (willingness to experience truth/truth events directly) (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). These two meanings are developed by Ramadan into two aspects, namely personal aspects and social aspects. Ramadan states "with the concept of creed, we can unite the two essential pillars of Islamic faith: clear provisions of personal identity through faith in God (*tawhid*) ... accompanied by the awareness that we bear the responsibility of reminding humans of God's existence and behaving with a noble character, so that we in the midst of humans, by itself becomes a reminder of the creator, spirituality, and ethics" (Tariq Ramadan, 1999).

These two aspects of the *shahadah* are then revealed to be the basic identity of a Muslim that universally applied to all Muslims, regardless of space and time. Personally, the identity of a Muslim is a person who has faith, acts of worship, maintains his spirituality, and makes the Qur'an a life guidance that he understands based on the text and context. As part of the family of community members, the identity of a Muslim is to convey the mandate of his faith and the truth he believes to

his family members through education and to the surrounding community through da'wah. While as part of the community a Muslim's identity is expressed in the form of personal acts of kindness and participation in social reform.

Education, based on the formulation of the *shahadah*, is a consequence of *tawhid*. When a person is making a *shahadah*, he is responsible for educating himself to believe and do good deeds, to keep his spiritual in accordance with the Qur'an. To be able to continue in accordance with the Qur'an, it also means that a Muslim must educate himself to understand the Qur'an based on the text and its context. If someone does not succeed in educating yourself, it means that he does not truly make *shahadah*. Meanwhile, educational activities for others are a consequence of the belief that "faith is trust or trust (trust)" that must be conveyed to the rightful (family, and community). The reluctance to deliver this deposit is the same as betraying faith in God.

Although there seems to be an encouragement for Muslims to invite other humans to witness the beauty of their faith, Ramadan believes in the free choice - even in their children - to become Muslims. Ramadan writes, "to pass on the message is to call and invite people to a real knowledge of the presence of God and to a true understanding of His teachings. Conversion is something that only God can accomplish, through His revelation, with each individual, and no other human being has the right to get involved in it" (Tariq Ramadan, 2016). Ramadan focuses on reforming Islamic thought in the era of globalization on Muslim identity with the method of thinking *aqidah* and *sharia*.

The reformation of Islamic thought which focused on the need for this identity was once stated by Muhammad Iqbal in the 19th century. Terence Ball states that the idea of Iqbal is still relevant and is the answer to the tension about identity as basically the mode of being as the essence of being” (Ball, 2003).

Iqbal was the formulator of modern theology in 19th-century Islam which continued the thought of Sayyid Khan. Sayyid Ahmad Khan was the first Islamic thought which in 1884 called for the need for *kalam jadid* (modern Islamic theology). At that time Muslims in India faced with the pressure of British colonialism which brought rational thinking. Khan felt the need to rearrange the presentation of Islam rationally. For Khan, the explanation of Islamic teachings such as tawhid, prophethood, and so on rationally does not conflict with Islamic teachings. Khan’s call for new Islamic theology identifies three alternative options for the new framework: (1) to refute the questions posed by modern science, (2) to question the accuracy of modern science, or (3) to accept modern science (Muhamad Khalid Masud, 2007). The idea of Khan’s theology is continued by Iqbal who emphasizes the perspective of religious identity as a counter to the individual concept of modernism. Iqbal proposes an identity that couches his anti-colonialism in autonomy that came from “adherence to faith” and “new jurisprudence” (Bose & Jalal, 1998).

According to Nataranjan (Nataranjan, 1996), Iqbāl is critical to colonial and capitalist modernity as well as to Islamic tradition that is incapable of responding to modern challenges. He formulates a dynamism in the Islamic tradition

of “dynamic selfness” (*khudi*) that can be “the creator of one’s own act” as well as enable them “to freely act on their own interests” (Lee, 2000). To support self-autonomy, Iqbal emphasizes the theory of the purpose of the Islamic law (*maqashid Syari’ah*) (Muhammad Khalid Masud, 1996). While Khan develops *Kalam Jadid* on the basis of his concern with the challenges posed by the discoveries of modern science, Iqbāl shifts the emphasis on society and the state, and from theology to law. This shift needs to be analyzed for two reasons; firstly as a shift in the objectivity of modernity, and secondly as a new Islamic framework for understanding and responding to new needs (Muhammad Khalid Masud, 1996). The political situation has changed between Khan and Iqbal. The Iqbal era was the era of nationalist agitation, self-determination, and mass politics. After two world wars and the abolition of the Caliphate, Muslims were involved in the nationalist movement for independence. The objectivity of Modernity in the Iqbal era was independence and national identity. Therefore, the political focus of encounter with colonial regimes shifts the debate from theology to law and state, from abstract to concrete and from mechanical to dynamic worldviews.

Tariq Ramadan faced a different problem; he was born and became a citizen of a secular State. “Is it permissible to live in Europe or America, or not, because both are parts of *dar al-harb* or, at least, *dar al-kufr*?” (Tariq Ramadan, 1999), Ramadan writes, Islamic scholars, according to Ramadan’s observations, still debate the ability of a Muslim to live in a secular state. Some scholars still consider the secular State as *dar al-harb* (an area that should be fought). Meanwhile in the secular country, “Many Muslims experience a feeling

of stigmatization and constant pressure: they feel those criticisms and this obsession with “the problem of Islam and Muslims” as aggressions, denials of their rights, and sometimes clearly racist and islamophobic expressions. They experience this daily: being a visible Muslim in the West today is no easy matter” (Tariq Ramadan, 2018). This situation challenged Ramadan —“to understand the universality of the message of Islam and to highlight the means we are given to help us live in our own time, in the West, with respect for ourselves and for others” (Tariq Ramadan, 2010a).

To live as a Muslim “in our own time,” Ramadan formulates changes in the status of non-Muslim countries from *dar al-harb* to *dar al-shahadah*. Ramadan then chooses the thoughts of Islamic jurists who allow a Muslim to live in a non-Muslim environment. Islamic scholars, according to Ramadan, have permitted a Muslim to live in a non-Muslim environment on two conditions, (a) he must be free to say the creed and practice his religion, and (b) he must benefit the community as a whole (Tariq Ramadan, 1999). These two conditions for Ramadan are not enough, the third requirement is needed, namely Muslims who live in the West must “give testimony (proof of the truth) to their teachings by reminding people of God and spirituality or by engaging in social or economic activities that will produce justice and better honor” (Tariq Ramadan, 1999).

Ramadan’s idea on being a Muslim and being a state citizen is the *Nahdlatul Ulama’s* (NU) theological ideology. However, the NU’s idea is slightly different within the context that Ramadan faced in Europe. Nevertheless, they deal with some similar challenges. Let’s take a look at Abdurachman

Wahid's description on the three steps of NU's recognition of Indonesia as a nation state. The first step is the acceptance of Indonesia as a motherland and a nation that need to be defended from any enemies as formulated in the 1936's NU conference motion in Banjarmasin: the Muslims are obliged to defend sovereign state territory or Islamic hemisphere and "the Muslims in this territory may observe Islamic teachings even though they are not officially in an Islamic state" (Wahid, 2004). At this stage, NU is similar to what Ramadan faced in Europe: being a Muslim in non-Islamic state. The second step: the acceptance of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia with its state ideology of *Pancasila* and the 1945 Constitution or the *Undang-Undang Dasar 1945*, and the Jihad Resolution in October 1945 that mandates all of Muslims to fight for the independence and defend the motherland as a struggle in the way of Allah (*jihad fi sabilillah*). At this stage, NU does not only accept the entity of the state but also co-found a state that is not based on the Islamic law. The third step: Indonesian Muslims' recognition of the government or state leader as stated in the resolution of Islamic Scholars' Convention in 1957 in Medan, that the President of the Republic of Indonesia is a '*waliyul amri dharuri bisy-syaukah*' (the appointed leader in state of emergency) (Wahid, 2003).

At this stage, the recognition of the secular leader is not found anywhere in Ramadan's thoughts. While from jurisprudence perspective, it is related to the very foundation of how Islamic law is legally implemented. Abdurrachman Wahid argues that this recognition is based upon that "The government [to be] seen and valued on its functionality and not on its formality as an Islamic state" (Wahid, 2004). NU

accepts the secular leader as the replacement of the “imam” (*waliyul amr*) or religious leader as a temporary leader as long as their leadership is effective for the interests of the Muslim citizens. NU also outlines that the acceptance is based on the concept of *al-saukah*, or the leader who is responsible of effective and responsible power in upholding Islamic obligations and preventing Islamic forbiddance (*Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar*) (Wahid, n.d.).

Abdurrahman Wahid and Tariq Ramadan both use fiqh as the basis of their theology. The acceptance of the Indonesian state as *dar al-sulh* is based on the rule of fiqh (legal maxim) which reads “*ma la yudraku kulluh la yutraku kulluh* (what cannot be fully realized, cannot be left out the most important in it)”, because it is not in the form of *dar al-salam*. The important thing is that NKRI allows Muslims to carry out the teachings of Islam in a reality. Besides that, Gus Dur also made the principle of *maslaha* in the *fiqh* of the standard of reference for his thoughts regarding the State and the indigenous of Islam. The application of *sharia* which is centered in the *maslahat* principle always accommodates local culture, insofar as the culture does not conflict with sharia principles. Gus Dur considers the conception of the State to be in the area of *al-mutaghayyirat* (rules that can change in Islamic teachings) rather than *al-thawabit* (permanent rules in Islamic teachings). *Al-thawabit* rules include the *aqidah* and *ubudiyah* (ritual) which are the standard and do not change throughout time and anywhere. While the rule of *al-mutaghayyirat* is located in the area of human and human relations, which is commonly called *mu'amalat* and *al-awa'id* (tradition and culture)(Sahal, 2017). Meanwhile, Ramadan

asserts that “Islamic teachings are firm as far as social affairs are concerned (muamalah) all facilities, traditions, art, customs that do not conflict with Islamic provisions, are not only accepted but also Islamic by definition” (Tariq Ramadan, 1999).

The NU’s concept of the recognition of the secular state is not of so much difference from Tariq Ramadan’s. However, according to Arifianto (Arifianto, 2017), NU’s ideology is too advanced for the grass root so the thoughts cannot be realized nor practiced by its members. At this point, this study tries to find the missing link by bringing the multicultural and progressive ideas into Islamic education

The thought of Ramadan education is indeed distinctive, but its orientation towards identity is similar to Iqbal’s educational orientation which focuses on khudi or true mankind (Rahman, 1985). Education is an inseparable part of human civilization, even the substance of human civilization (S. al- Nadwi, 1995). Education according to Iqbal is actually aimed at forming a true “human” (Rahman, 1985), who can “inspire the world with deed” (Maarif, 1995). In this case, Muhammad Iqbal views the Western education system as “having no conscience, numbness, death in peace”, while traditional Islamic education at that time did not have *himmah*, weak minds, and poor inductive experience (A. H. al-Nadwi, 1987).

K.G. Saiyidain in the book *Iqbal’s Educational Philosophy* (Saiyidain, 1981) puts forward eight views of Iqbal about education. First, Iqbal’s education must be able to foster the characteristics of human individuality in order to become perfect human beings. What is meant by perfect human

beings, according to Iqbal, is that humans can create divine attributes incarnate in themselves so that they behave like God. These properties are absorbed into him so that there is a total unification. Second, education, in this case, must be able to direct the growth and development of individuals in the optimal direction, so that individuals not only live passively adjusting to their environment. Third, education must be able to develop inner wealth from its essence. Fourth, education that can provide a deep understanding of the nature of engagement between the lives of individuals and the culture of society. Fifth, education must encourage human creativity to be able to escape from limitations, penetrate and conquer time. Sixth, education should pay attention to human intellectual aspects and their intuition at the same time. Seventh, education should be able to foster three traits which are the main elements of man, namely courage, tolerance and concern. Eighth, education that can encourage individuals to organize social life and material environment should be carried out on the basis and principles of *tawhid*.

Although educational thinking based on Muslim human identity and participatory tolerance towards space has been developed by Iqbal and Abdurrahman Wahid, Ramadan has an important breakthrough in the formulation of Islamic education theology. The breakthrough is to make educational activities the basic core of faith, which in Islamic thought a classical position in education that is placed as a basis for the whole, is not yet specific (Alhamuddin, 2018). Through this thinking Islamic educational organizations such as madrassas, in addition to being able to balance the challenges of change with a unique leadership style (Suyadi & Widodo, 2019) and

carry out transformations in the face of millennialisation (Alhamuddin, 2018), can continue to adapt to the challenges of the secular public space while still relying on faith.

C. Conclusion

Tariq Ramadan shows that the genuine Islamic education ideology is based on three aspects. First, education as the core of Islamic theology. Ramadan argues that “there’s no faith without understanding and there’s no understanding without education”. Second, the purpose of education is to enable Muslims to possess Islamic identity and be committed to God and implement their faiths in upholding justice in community. Ramadan builds the identity concept by interpreting the *shahadah* as the commitment of the faithful and the civic (not only to the Muslims). The first aim of the education is to create good Muslims and the second is to build humble, careful and tolerant society. The third is to transform the pupils’ experiences in plurality to other people including by doing education in the family and immediate community.

The study has shown that by using Ricoeur’s hermeneutics we can relate Tariq Ramadan’s thought to other thinkers such as Habermas, Mohammad Iqbal from Pakistan, and Abdurrahman Wahid from Indonesia. In the stage of transfiguration, it might be said that Ramadan’s concept is not unfamiliar within the context of Indonesia and hence is applicable in this country. By amalgamating Ramadan’s and Abdurrahman Wahid’s concepts, the Indonesian Islamic education is based on the *shahadah* and local wisdom simultaneously. Public spaces are not only places of self-realization (*dar al-shahada*) but also as the places of peace (*dar al-sulh*).

The study is conceptual in nature as it mainly regards the Islamic education theology to create tolerance. To make it more operational, it needs to be incorporated in the curriculum and the education managerial system.

REFERENCES

- Abdallah, A. (2016). Exclusivism and Radicalism in Schools: State Policy and Educational Politics Revisited. *Studia Islamika*, 23(3). <https://doi.org/10.15408/sdi.v23i3.4425>.
- Abdullah, M. A. (1998). Problem Epistemologis Metodologis Pendidikan Islam. In A. M. Mulkan (Ed.), *Religiusitas Iptek*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Al-Alwani, T. J. (2005, April). Unacceptable Allegation.
- al- Nadwi, A. H. (1987). *Pendidikan Islam yang Mandiri* (1st ed.; A. Muhammad, Trans.). Bandung: Dunia Ilmu.
- al- Nadwi, S. (1995). Mohammad Iqbal, al-Ḥaḍarah al-Gharbīyah wa Qaḍayā al-Tajdīd. *Studia Islamika*, 2(1), 171.
- Alhamuddin, A. (2018). Abd Shamad al-Palimbani's Concept of Islamic Education: Analysis on Kitab Hidayah al-Sālikin fi Suluk Māsālāk lil Muttāqin. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 6(1), 89–102. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v6i1.3717>
- Ar-Rawi, A. (2005). An Impotent Call. Retrieved from Islam Online website: <http://www.islamonline.net/servlet/Satellite>.
- Arifianto, A. R. (2017). Practicing What It Preaches? Understanding the Contradictions between Pluralist Theology and Religious Intolerance within Indonesia's Nahdlatul Ulama. *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 55(2), 241–264. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2017.552.241-264>.

- Aspinall, E., & Warburton, E. (2018). Indonesia: The Dangers of Democratic Regression. *Proceedings of the Third International Conference on Social and Political Sciences (ICSPPS 2017)*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icpps-17.2018.1>.
- Azca, M. N., Ikhwan, H., & Arrobi, M. Z. (2019). A tale of Two Royal Cities, The Narratives of Islamists' Intolerance in Yogyakarta and Solo. *Al-Jāmi'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 57(1), 25–50.
- Baidhawiy, Z. (2007). Building harmony and peace through multiculturalist theology-based religious education: an alternative for contemporary Indonesia. *British Journal of Religious Education*, 29(1), 15–30. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200601037478>.
- Ball, T. (Ed.). (2003). *The Cambridge History of Twentieth Century Political Thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bose, S., & Jalal, A. (1998). *Modern South Asia, History, Culture and Political Economy*. New York: Routledge.
- Buruma, I. (2010). *Taming the Gods: Religion and Democracy on Three Continents*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Butler, J. (2009). "The Sensibility of Critique: Response to Asad and Mahmood," in Talal Asad (ed), *Is Critique Secular?: Blasphemy, Injury, and Free Speech*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Carle, R. (2011). Tariq Ramadan and the quest for a moderate Islam. *Society*, 48(1), 58–69.
- Esack, F. (2005). *The Qur'an: A User's Guide*. Oxford: Oneworld Publications.
- Freedom House. (2018). Freedom World 2018 Table of Country Scores. Retrieved September 3, 2019, from Freedom House website: <https://freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-world-2018-table-country-scores>.

- Hadiz, V. R. (2017). Indonesia's Year of Democratic Setbacks: Towards a New Phase of Deepening Illiberalism? *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies*, 53(3), 261–278. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00074918.2017.1410311>.
- Hanafi, H. (2005). *Min al-Nash ila al-Waqi' Bunyah al-Nash, Dar Al-Midar al-Islami*. Libya: Humanities Press.
- Haryatmoko. (2000). Hermeneutika Paul Ricoeur Transparansi sebagai Proses. *Basis*.
- Kamrava, M. (2006). "Introduction: Reformist Islam in Comparative Perspective". In M. Kamrava, *The New Voices of Islam, Reforming Politics and Modernity - A Reader*, London & New York: I. B. Tauris & Co.
- Kaul, V. (2010). Jürgen Habermas, Tariq Ramadan and Michael Walzer in a dialogue on politics and religion. *Philosophy & Social Criticism*, 36(3–4), 505–516. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0191453709360340>.
- Kuhn, T. S. (1962). *The Structure of Scientific Revolution*, Leiden: Instituut Voor Theoretische Biologie.
- Lee, R. D. (2000). *Mencari Islam Autentik*. Bandung: Mizan.
- Liddle, R. W., & Mujani, S. (2013). Indonesian Democracy From Transition to Consolidation. In M. Künkler & A. Stepan (Eds.), *Democracy and Islam in Indonesia*. <https://doi.org/10.7312/kunk16190-006>.
- Ma'arif, S. (2019). Reinventing Pesantren's Moderation Culture to Build a Democratic Society in the Post-Reform Republic of Indonesia. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, 27(3), 1739–1751.
- Maarif, A. S. (1995). *Membumikan Islam* (2nd ed.). Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Madjid, N. (1992). *Islam Doktrin dan Peradaban: Sebuah Telaah Kritis tentang Masalah Keimanan, Kemanusiaan dan Kemodernan*. Jakarta: Paramadina.
- March, A. F. (2007). Reading Tariq Ramadan: Political

- Liberalism, Islam, and “Overlapping Consensus.” *Ethics & International Affairs*, 11.
- Masamah, U., & Huda, M. (2016). Multicultural Education and The Nationalistic Reality (Photograph The Role of Teachers In Building A Multicultural Awareness In Indonesia). *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 4(1), 68–81.
- Masud, M. K. (1996). *Shatibi's Philosophy of Islamic Law*. Islamabad: Islamic Research Institute.
- Masud, M. K. (2007). *Iqbal Approachs to Islamic Theology of Modernity* (Vol. 27). Al-Hikmat.
- Mietzner, M. (2018). Fighting Illiberalism with Illiberalism: Islamist Populism and Democratic Deconsolidation in Indonesia. *Pacific Affairs*, 91(2), 261–282. <https://doi.org/10.5509/2018912261>.
- Miftah, M. (2016). Multicultural Education In The Diversity Of National Cultures. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 4(2), 167. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v4i2.1766>.
- Mujani, S. (2019). Explaining Religio-Political Tolerance Among Muslims: Evidence from Indonesia. *Studia Islamika*, 26(2). <https://doi.org/10.15408/sdi.v26i2.11237>.
- Nasr, S. H. (1991). *Islamic Spirituality; Manifestations*. New York: SCM Pres.
- Nataranjan, N. (Ed.). (1996). *Handbook of Twentieth Century Literature of India*. Westport CT: Greenwood Press.
- Nurhisam, L., & Huda, M. (2016). Islam Nusantara: A Middle Way? *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 4(2), 152. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v4i2.1763>.
- Nurwanto, & Cusack, C. M. (2017). Addressing multicultural societies: lessons from religious education curriculum policy in Indonesia and England. *Journal of Religious*

- Education*, 64(3), 157–178. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40839-017-0040-x>.
- Ourghi, M. (2010). Tariq Ramadan: From a Mere Co-Existence to an Authentic Contribution of Europe's Muslims. *Journal of Religion in Europe*, 3(2), 285–309. <https://doi.org/10.1163/187489210x501545>.
- Parker, L. (2016). Religious environmental education? The new school curriculum in Indonesia. *Environmental Education Research*, 23(9), 1249–1272. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13504622.2016.1150425>.
- PPIM, H. (2018). *Survey PPIM 2018: "Pelita yang Meredup: Potret Keberagaman Guru di Indonesia"*, PPIM Jakarta dan Convey.
- Qomaruzzaman, B., Al Bustomi, A. G., & Busro, B. (2018). Living Values Education dan Surat Cinta Untuk Nabi: Pendidikan Menghidupkan Nilai Damai di Indonesia. *Al-Tahrir: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 18(1), 112. <https://doi.org/10.21154/altahrir.v18i1.1202>.
- Rahman, F. (1985). *Islam dan Modernitas, Tentang Transformasi Intelektual, alih bahasa Ahsin Mohammad* (1st ed.). Bandung: Pustaka.
- Raihani, R. (2017). Education for multicultural citizens in Indonesia: policies and practices. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2017.1399250>.
- Ramadan, T. (n.d.). Transcendent and His Name. Retrieved from Tariq Ramadan Official Website website: <https://tariqramadan.com/english/the-transcendent-and-his-names/>.
- Ramadan, T. (1999). *To be European Muslim: A Study of Islamic Sources in the European Context*. UK: The Islamic Foundation.
- Ramadan, T. (2003). *Western Muslims and the Future of Islam*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Ramadan, T. (2004). *Muslims and the Future of Islam*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Ramadan, T. (2008). *Radical Reform, Islamic Ethic and Liberation*. London: Oxford University.
- Ramadan, T. (2009). *In the Footsteps of the Prophet*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ramadan, T. (2010). *The quest for meaning: Developing a philosophy of pluralism*. London: Penguin.
- Ramadan, T. (2010a). *Western Muslims Developing a Philosophy of Pluralism*. New York: Penguin Book.
- Ramadan, T. (2010b). *What I Believe*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ramadan, T. (2016). Education and Transmission. Retrieved from Tariq Ramadan Official Website website: <https://tariqramadan.com/english/education-and-transmission/>.
- Ramadan, T. (2018). Interacting Crises. Retrieved from Tariq Ramadan Official Website website: <https://tariqramadan.com/english/interacting-crises/>.
- Resse, L. W. (1980). *Dictionary of Philosophy and Religion Eastern and Western Thought*. Atlantic Highland: Humanities Press.
- Rohmatin, T. (2016). Nilai-Nilai Pluralisme dalam Buku Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) untuk Sekolah Menengah Atas (SMA). *Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 5(1), 131–150.
- Saekan, M. (2017). Islamic Education Unifying Nation. *QIJIS (International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 5(2). <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v5i2.2484>.
- Sahal, A. (2017, March). Islam dan Arab: Menimbang Pribumisasi Islam Gus Dur.
- Saiyidain, K. G. (1981). *Percikan Filsafat Iqbal Mengenai Pendidikan (translated by M.I. Soelaeman)* (1st ed.). Bandung: Diponegoro.

- Suharto, T. (2017). Transnational Islamic education in Indonesia: an ideological perspective. *Contemporary Islam*, 12(2), 101–122. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11562-017-0409-3>.
- Suyadi, S., & Widodo, H. (2019). Millennialization of Islamic Education Based on Neuroscience in the Third Generation University in Yogyakarta Indonesia. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 7(1), 173–202. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v7i1.4922>.
- Tampio, N. (2011). Constructing the Space of Testimony: Tariq Ramadan's Copernican Revolution. *Political Theory*, 39(5), 600–629.
- Wahid, A. (n.d.). NU dan Pancasila. Retrieved from GUSDUR. Net website: <http://www.gusdur.net/id/gagasan/gagasan-gus-dur/nu-dan-pancasila>.
- Wahid, A. (2003, February). Negara dan Kepemimpinan Dalam Islam. Retrieved from GUSDUR.Net (source: Kedaulatan Rakyat) website: <http://www.gusdur.net/id/gagasan/gagasan-gus-dur/negara-dan-kepemimpinan-dalam-islam>.
- Wahid, A. (2004). NU dan Paham Kebangsaan. Retrieved from GUSDUR.Net (source: Proaksi-Jakarta) website: <http://www.gusdur.net/id/gagasan/gagasan-gus-dur/nu-dan-paham-kebangsaan>.
- Zainiyati, H. S. (2016). Curriculum, Islamic Understanding and Radical Islamic Movements In Indonesia. *Journal of Indonesian Islam*, 10(2), 285. <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2016.10.2.285-308>.
- Zuhdi, M. (2005). Religious Education in Indonesian Schools Religious Education in Indonesian Schools. *International Conference on Redesigning Pedagogy: Research, Policy and Practice*.