

LOCAL GOVERNMENT VIOLENCE AND VIGILANTE AMONG MUSLIM FEMALE SEX WORKERS

Fahrudin Ali Sabri

Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya, Indonesia

didin021@gmail.com

Eko Ariwidodo

Universitäts Wien, Vienna, Austria

ekarwdd@gmail.com

Arif Wahyudi

Institut Agama Islam Negeri Madura Pamekasan, Indonesia

arifwahyudi@iainmadura.ac.id

Mila Diana Sari

Universitas Merdeka Malang PDKU Ponorogo, Indonesia

mila.sari@unmer.ac.id

Abstract

This article examines the cultural ethos of Muslim Madurese, Indonesian women who work as sex workers in interacting with state actors who abuse their power and with vigilante practices from non-state actors. Empirical data in this study were collected through interactive dialogue to place the key informants (sex workers) in an equal position with the researcher. The efforts built by Muslim female sex workers can be interpreted as a form of courage in fighting against violence and human rights violations. The strategies used are: a) migrants only want to provide sex services where they feel safe from violence. Some of these location choices navigate sex workers and clients to eliminate or minimize the dire risks

of their activities for the sake of a comfort zone for safety. Sex workers deposit dues at a particular place to give them to the officer's element. They feel safe from raid operations and perceive that their rights are a form of settlement from threats of arrest. They hope that Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) and Muhammadiyah can provide moral, economic, and educational support to get rid of this prostitution, and hope that there will be help from NU that can protect them from violence as Banser protects churches. They have specific signal codes during a raid, such as always holding a cell phone to get information from clients and trying to memorize the faces of the officers who usually carry out the operation. This finding ultimately emphasizes the importance of protecting Muslim women sex workers through state authorities, legal officers, and civil society groups to support policy, legal, and practice reforms in Madura, Indonesia, so that they can avoid violence.

Keywords: Muslim Female Sex Workers, Violence, Abuse of Power, Vigilante.

A. Introduction

Rudyard Kipling metaphorically states that prostitution is the oldest profession in the world (Mattson, 2015), and pimping is the second oldest profession (Reitman, 1936). There are two types of professions found in all countries, including Indonesia: 1) direct forms like brothels; windows or doorways; street; escorts; private; club, pub, bar, karaoke bar, dance hall; other all-male venues; door knock or hotel; transport (ships, trucks, trains); CB radio; other methods of solicitation. 2) Indirect forms like bondage and discipline; lap dancing; parlor massage; traveling entertainers; beer girls; street vendors and traders; opportunistic; femme libre; individual arrangements; swingers club; geisha; 'sex for drugs'; beachboys, bumsters, and gigolos; and survival sex (Graaf et al., 1992; Harcourt & Donovan, 2005; Hull, 2017; Surratt et al., 2005).

Various countries have legal attitudes toward prostitution, including Prohibitionism, neo-abolitionism, and abolitionism (Barnett & Casavant, 2014; Rigotti, 2021). Indonesia is one of the countries that legalize prostitution, and abolitionism considers prostitution legal, but there is a ban on public solicitations, brothel operations, and pimps (Awaludin, 2019; Hull, 2017; Kholifah, 2016). The criminalization of sex workers shows a vulnerability to violence, which will eventually lead to discrimination, stigmatization, and vigilantism.

This article examines the experiences of Muslim women from Madura, Indonesia, who work as sex workers who are classified as street vendors (Harcourt & Donovan, 2005) by using dimly lit coffee shops as locations for prostitution (Beazley, 2015) in dealing with state and non-state actors. The empirical data in this study is based on the interactions of female Muslim sex workers with clients, police, Satpol PP officers, members of religious groups, pimps, and the general public and the tools used to navigate their struggles with poverty and violence. The dialogue was chosen as a data collection technique, carried out from March 2021 to October 2021, with six research participants who were Madurese Muslim women who worked as coffee shop keepers and supplemented their income as sex workers.

As an ethnographer, the author uses a dialogue technique to form an equal relationship between the researcher and the others (Carspecken, 2013: 54). It is easier for researchers to extract information from sex workers, including revealing their experiences in producing knowledge to avoid violence. Sex workers are invited to dialogue with their consent, and

this activity is also used to make observations. In addition, the author uses interview techniques with other informants, such as clients, police, Satpol PP officers, members of religious groups, and the general public.

The ethics of research into the ethnography of prostitution (de Wildt, 2016; Dewey & Zheng, 2013: 32-36; Sinha, 2017) requires the author's team always to show a familiar face so that they have at least some evidence that this research shows the author's concern for them. The author's team did not keep a record of the names of the female sex workers, asking them not to name anyone else. Ultimately, she did; the researchers did not record them in subsequent transcriptions to maximize confidentiality. In this article, researchers refer to sex workers as PSK A, PSK B, PSK C, PSK D, PSK E, and PSK F.

B. The Risk of Daily Violence on Sex Workers

This violence or "violence" comes from the Latin "violentia"; the perpetrators are categorized as violators of norms, rights, or rules (Bufacchi, 2005), where the violence must-have elements of a change that is worse than its original forms, such as wounds, injuries, trauma, neglect or other modifications (Honderich, 2003). Violence is a 'slick concept' that is difficult to understand if you only look partially at the physical, psychological, and economic changes experienced by the victim. After the violence occurs, new violence can arise, and individuals can perpetrate that, society and the State through attacks on personalities, dignity, and self-esteem (Scheper-Hughes & Bourgois, 2004). Understanding of violence can be expressed by listening to the way individuals

tell stories about violent events they have experienced and given their meanings and then juxtaposing them with the social context, a culture of violence, the role of the state, and the structure of society (Merry, 2016: 46).

Sex workers are a vulnerable group who may experience violence and exploitation in their daily lives (World Health Organization, 2013), a violation of human rights. If explored in more detail, the root of violence against them comes from the construction (power inequality) of power inequality and gender inequity (Goodyear & Auger, 2013: 218). Inequality after inequality becomes intertwined when this sex worker is an indigenous woman who deserves to experience violence and does not deserve to report her violence to the police (Carter, 1993). Negative attitudes from clients and the community participate in perpetuating stigmatization, which will eventually lead to discrimination, human rights violations, and violence against sex workers (Armstrong, 2011: 203). The Muslim community, still steadfast in perpetuating patriarchal culture, also contributes to violence against women (Febriandi et al., 2021). Concrete steps are needed to overcome the roots of violence against sex workers. Commercial sex workers who depart from the factors of poverty, exclusion from socio-cultural life, and low education (Artaria & Kinasih, 2017) must advance their economic, educational, and cultural interests so that they get their dignity as humans. An inclusive and non-discriminatory policy is needed in dealing with them (Amal, 2020).

Studies on violence against sex workers in Indonesia have identified clients, intimate partners, police, Satpol PP officers, members of religious groups, thugs, pimps, and

the general public as perpetrators of violence (Irwanto & Praptoraharjo, 2014; Suyanto et al., 2020). Instead of protecting sex workers, state actors carry out brutality (Irwanto & Praptoraharjo, 2014). State actors appear to be more potent than sex workers, as seen from the symbols they have (Arinta & Zakiah, 2017; Ayu S Joni et al., 2019). On the other hand, non-state actors also take vigilante action, which results in violence against sex workers (Barker, 2007; Irwanto & Praptoraharjo, 2014; Kingston, 2013). However, the violence that often occurs does not affect the development of the sex worker population in Indonesia (“Estimates and Projection of HIV/Aids in Indonesia 2015-2020,” 2017; Sidibé, 2018).

Studies on violence against sex workers by state actors can be found, for example, the understanding of sex workers in Denver, Colorado, the United States of America, against police who can abuse their power based on mentality, impunity, and ignorance of the scope of police power, and strategies of sex workers in dealing with police raids (Dewey & St. Germain, 2014). Likewise, the understanding of sex workers in Ibadan, Nigeria, in dealing with violence and human rights violations by law enforcement officers (Aborisade, 2019). In addition, attacks from non-state actors against sex workers who hang out in coffee shops still occur from the government regime to the next administration (Panggabean et al., 2010). In connection with some of these studies, this article would like to show the experience and knowledge production of sex workers in Madura, Indonesia, setting up a resistance strategy in the face of violence from state and non-state actors. The narrative built by Muslim female sex workers must be interpreted as a

form of her courage in fighting against violence and human rights violations.

C. Street Vendors Prostituted Women Muslim's Narrative Responses to The Violence

This section examines the experiences of female Muslim sex workers in interacting with clients, the police, Satpol PP officers, members of religious groups, and the general public in Madura. The discussion in this article covers five themes, namely: (1) Working conditions for street vendors of prostituted women Muslim; (2) State legal system (local government) on prostitution; (3) State actors violence against Street vendors prostituted women Muslim; (4) A memory of street vendors prostituted women Muslim to encounter vigilantes from non-state actors; (5) Resistance strategy against violence. These five themes were chosen to describe the narratives of Muslim female sex workers in navigating their struggles against poverty and violence and their strategy of resistance against state and non-state actors.

1. Working conditions on street vendors prostituted women Muslim

In Madura, the night market, which is held the night before the bull race (*karapan sapi*), is an event that can generate income for hawkers, "*ludruk*" players, and sex workers (Jonge, 1990). Sex workers use the market to attract clients; then, they set up a coffee shop located in the market on August 17 (Pasar 17

Agustus), Pamekasan, or the sidewalk in front of the market. The use of this coffee shop is an indirect form of prostitution. The August 17 market is used in this study to refer to areas with a reasonably high concentration of prostitution, marked by the establishment of coffee shops that also accommodate sex workers. This place for transactions and locations for sexual relations does not appear to provide liquor or drugs.

The coffee shop keepers, who also increase their income as sex workers every day, depart from the boarding house to the coffee shop inside the market at 7 am, wear unsexy clothes, open a coffee shop until 5 pm, and then return to the boarding house (PSK A, 2021). They rested 2 hours ago, from 7 pm to 11 pm, opening a coffee shop on the sidewalk, which is located in front of the stalled building (PSK E, 2021). Sex workers have their own space and time (Goodyear & Auger, 2013) without regulating and dictating the employer. However, their interests and needs are handled and dictated (Murray, 1987:149). It contrasts with capitalist space and time, where proletarian workers are traditionally and routinely regulated and dictated by their employers (Thrift, 1983).

At first glance, people do not know that the coffee shop keeper is a sex worker; this can be seen in their appearance, who tries not to be seen as a sex worker. They are dressed not sexy, with powder or lipstick that is not thick and without body fragrance (observation, 2021) either in front of clients or girlfriends (Wolffers, 1999); this is the opposite of the appearance of sex workers outside street vendors and traders (Kay Hoang, 2010).

However, they do not hesitate to offer sex services to men who visit the coffee shop without any suspicion that they are Satpol PP officers (Prostitute B, 2021).

Some coffee shop keepers who claim to be devout Muslims continue to carry out prayer orders; from the ringtones of their cellphones, they can hear verses and prayers. Some have children who study in Islamic boarding schools (Prostitute D, 2021). When this prospective client is interested in sexual services, the sex worker offers an area in the coffee shop for sex services with a cot made of plywood with a banner base and dirty pillows (Prostitute A, 2021; Prostitute B, 2021). Sex workers and clients can stay in hotels they know as 'friends' for one night or less (Prostitute C, 2021).

The coffee shop keepers use tricks to steal clients' hearts with words such as 'sayang', 'bobok yuk', 'gituan yuk', 'mau pao (mango/*pelem*-Javanese: a metaphor for 'pelempuan'), 'ingin anget-anget'? etc.; or physically, such as groping or massaging the prospective client's limbs. Potential clients will signal commercial sex workers and negotiate prices (Womanizer A, 2021). When there is an agreement on price and location; usually, the two of them immediately go to the couch, in a stalled building, or to a friendly hotel to have sexual intercourse (Observation, 2021). The two locations chosen and decided by these sex workers reflect concern for the comfort zone for safety (Aborisade, 2019). All sex workers tend to refuse sites offered by clients, such as cars, unfamiliar hotels, or other unsafe zones, unless invited by clients known to them and the owner of a coffee shop (Womanizer B, 2021).

During the day, PSK (floozy or commercial sex workers) A and PSK B, who come from outside Madura as migrants, usually choose sex services in a coffee shop at night in the building stalled with a tarpaulin base. This choice was made because apart from being comfortable with the security provided by the owner of the coffee shop with their husbands and thugs, they would immediately seek and serve new clients without wasting time and effort. Most importantly, the coffee shop is an attractive option over the hotel because the income is the same and minimizes the anxiety of avoiding raids or public anger. They choose to refuse to be invited out of coffee shops to provide sexual services except with clients they already know, such as in cars, houses, boarding houses, or hotels, that they do not understand (Prostitute A, 2021; Prostitute B, 2021).

PSK C, as a migrant, feels comfortable providing sex services in a hotel he knows because he feels safe from police raids and refuses to offer sex services in coffee shops (Prostitute C, 2021). Likewise, PSK D and PSK E, which are local people, limit the location of sex services at hotels and refuse to follow clients out of familiar hotel locations because they are afraid that the public will know their work (Prostitute D, 2021; Prostitute E, 2021). All sex workers admitted that they were reluctant to fulfill clients' known and unknown requests to provide sex services in private homes or boarding houses. This reluctance is triggered by worry and fear of being raided, expelled, and harassed by the community. PSK F, as a migrant, only wants to provide sex services in a safe

place from violence, such as asking for help, shouting, or running at any time. There is an unwanted and predictable danger; she feels that the risk of experiencing violence when serving clients does exist. However, the risk must be anticipated (Prostitute F, 2021).

From several options, this location navigates sex workers and clients to eliminate or minimize the adverse risks of their activities for the sake of a comfort zone for safety. Sex workers tend to have the freedom to choose their place of residence, location of sex services, clothing, and what they consume (Hammad, 2016).

2. State legal system on prostitution in Madura

The Indonesian State, which adheres to abolitionists, makes the legal status of sex workers unclear; the Criminal Code only regulates the prohibition of pimping, as stated in Article 296 jo. Article 506. Nevertheless, strangely there are dozens of regional regulations that provide criminal sanctions for sex workers (Regional Regulations on Prostitution, 2021); on the other hand, there are many district court decisions that use Article 27 (1) Law no. 19 of 2016 on the Amendment to Law No. 11 of 2008 on Electronic Information and Transactions as well as Law No. 44 of 2008 on Pornography to punish online sex workers (INDONESIA, 2018) as stated in the District Court Decision Number 472/Pid.Sus/2020/PN Pdg (Decision of the Padang District Court, 2021).

The people of Pamekasan Regency tolerate the activities of coffee shop keepers who also increase their

income with sex services. Every day, they can still open coffee shops without any interference or threats from the community, except in the past as long as there was FPI, which sometimes carried out sweeping. However, sex workers are constantly wary of raid operations carried out by Satpol PP officers (All Prostitutes, 2021). This Satpol PP institution works based on regional regulation no. 18 of 2004 concerning the prohibition of prostitution (Hasanurrahman, 2021).

Satpol PP officers who conduct raids are provided with psychological provisions not to abuse their authority; they have the slogan that the Satpol PP institution is “persuasive, humanist and educative.” The officer once made one of its members act as a spy, where, at first, the Satpol PP institution had an intelligence section, but for some reason, the intelligence section no longer exists. However, Civil Servant Investigators in the Satpol PP institution have the authority to seek information on prostitution violations, for example, those in the community either looking for themselves or ordering other people.

In the last two years, the Satpol PP institution enforced the Regional Regulation by arresting four sex workers in 2021, while in 2020, no sex workers were netted (get caught up) in raids. Satpol PP officers arrested four sex workers at a coffee shop in the Pasar area on August 17, Pamekasan. Upon discovering the violation, these sex workers were taken to the Civil Service Police Unit and Fire Department Pamekasan. They made a work report or Memorandum of Service

and documentation of the enforcement of social order activities with administrative sanctions and guidance from personal agencies.

In the period before the COVID-19 pandemic, sex workers caught in raids would be handed over to the Social Service, such as sex workers from Sumenep handed over to the Sumenep Social Service office. However, during this pandemic, the Social Service seemed less effective in providing guidance, so the Satpol institution PP offers direct advice to sex workers. The Satpol PP institution conducts raids based on reliable and valid A1 information from public complaints or disguised members not to carry out random charges. However, in the end, the Satpol PP admitted that they could not guarantee that these sex workers would disappear in Pamekasan (Hasanurrahman, 2021; Sukandar, 2021).

The Satpol PP institution conducts post-raid monitoring to ensure that sex workers caught in the raids do not return to Pamekasan. The Satpol PP institution has a way to prevent captured sex workers from returning to Pamekasan again, such as making sex workers viral through the media, both electronic and print media, to provide a deterrent effect to sex workers. The Satpol PP institution fosters sex workers through humanist and educative persuasive actions. However, the Satpol PP institution considered that this raid did not guarantee a decrease in the number of sex workers in Pamekasan.

The Satpol PP institution found that sex workers in Pamekasan Regency came from inside and outside Pamekasan Regency, although, on average, those caught

were sex workers from outside Pamekasan Regency. The officers identified sex workers who did not live in boarding houses or hotels but rented houses because perhaps boarding houses and hotels were considered unsafe because Satpol PP officers often monitored them. Officers feel that the tobacco harvest season in Pamekasan does not affect whether or not prostitution is crowded, so patrols in boarding houses, hotels, and coffee shops are always carried out and do not recognize a particular time (Hasanurrahman, 2021; Sukandar, 2021).

On the other hand, the police are not authorized to deal with sex workers, only with pimping practices and places that provide prostitution. The police admitted that they always use Standard Operating Procedures in carrying out their duties in prostitution raids; they will be provided with a warrant to carry out their responsibilities because the police is an organization in which there is a lead and is led. Before going into the field, the investigators are given a Troop Leader's Direction or APP, which members of the Pamekasan Police need to do before carrying out their duties, such as submitting tactics or methods to carry out legal action.

The police have a legal basis for carrying out prostitution raid operations; the legal rules still refer to the Criminal Code. Those who carry out raids have been given psychological provisions not to abuse their authority and violate the law, especially if they do not respect human rights. If the woman works as a commercial sex worker, she has the right to be treated well and not treated arbitrarily.

In 2021 the police arrested two suspected pimps from Lumajang and Bondowoso. Pamekasan Police officers obtain data by conducting raids and when asked for information. For male and female pimps, both of whom had the initials S. The two pimps who were migrants were detained for three months in the Pamekasan Police Precinct. The police admit that they do not discriminate against pimps or place managers who provide prostitution. The police will conduct raids based on A1's information (Sugianto, Police, 2021).

State actors seem to have difficulty in conducting raids on sex workers and pimps; apart from information A1 instead of state actors reprimanding or taking action against them, they still hang around and are in coffee shops waiting for clients while playing cellphones hoping clients are asking for sex services (Observation, 2021). These sex workers claim to have been caught by Satpol PP officers; they admit that they are aware that this work is hard, uncomfortable, dangerous, and full of risks.

3. State actor's violence against street vendors prostituted women Muslim

In its development, many faces result from the interaction of police-prostitutes, namely good police officers, unresponsive officers, police officers as protectors, police officers as perpetrators, police as paying customers, and beneficiary police officers (Williamson et al., 2007). During the COVID-19 pandemic, all sex workers complained about the restrictions imposed by Satpol PP

officers through the implementation of Large-Scale Social Restrictions (PSBB) or the Enforcement of Community Activity Restrictions (PPKM). In the tobacco harvest season, which is usually the client's harvest season for sex workers, it turns out to be counterproductive to this restriction. Anxiety and fear of declining income are happening. However, they are aware that this Satpol PP officer is tasked with eradicating prostitution. There is good behavior among the Satpol PP officers; some are jerks (Prostitute A, 2021).

All sex workers who claim to have experienced physical, verbal, psychological, and economic violence from Satpol PP officers in the form of encouragement are loaded onto a patrol vehicle with an open back, shouts, threats, and innuendos, taking pictures or paying the ransom. They are unaware and do not know that this violence is a human rights violation. They consider this violence part of the job risks that must be accepted.

PSK E and PSK F admitted they had the urge to ride in a pickup truck during raids and take pictures without permission. They claimed to be ashamed of their photos published in online mass media with news of the arrest of sex workers in Pamekasan (Prostitute E, 2021; Prostitute F, 2021). PSK A could only surrender when there was a raid at the coffee shop, and then a jerk Satpol PP officer threatened and demanded a ransom of Rp 300,000. He felt confused and dizzy with the ransom and, in the end, borrowed the ransom money from the coffee shop owner. The reason for giving this ransom was not to be sent back to his place of origin. Satpol PP officers also yelled at him

with the words, “You again, you again, why don’t you give up and why don’t you go back to Madura.” (Prostitute A, 2021). The story of unscrupulous Satpol PP officers asking for ransom, yelling, and threatening to be sent back to their hometowns is also experienced by PSK B (Prostitute B, 2021). Both of them can only complain to the shop owner, the coffee shop vendor, the customer, and their family for the verbal, psychological, and economic violence from the Satpol PP officer, without any awareness and understanding of the laws that apply in Indonesia, if this incident can be reported. They only complain to these third parties and usually end up with no resolution to their complaints. The third party only shows empathy and hopes they will be more careful when a raid occurs. (Prostitute A, 2021; Prostitute B, 2021).

Economic violence was also experienced by PSK C and PSK D, who admitted to depositing dues money at the hotel receptionist to give to the police. It was done so that he felt safe and comfortable from raid operations and considered the fee money as a form of settlement of threats of arrest. Both assured each client that having sex in the hotel would be safe from raids. They claimed to have paid ten years to the police through the hotel reception and managed to escape the charge. Although not much, the dues make her comfortable (Prostitute C, 2021; Prostitute D, 2021).

All sex workers are not aware that this state actor’s treatment is a form of violence, but they ignore this treatment rather than report it. They are not aware that a legal system will support and assist them

in fighting violence and harassment from state actors. As a result of this violence, they feel confused, dizzy, and traumatic, which can shake them psychologically (all prostitutes, 2021).

4. A Memory of Street vendors prostituted women Muslim to encounter vigilantes from non-State Actors

The risk of violence from state actors not only overshadows sex workers but also overshadows the threat of violence from non-state actors. They are aware that they live among a Madurese religious community that adheres to the phrases: “bhuppa’, bhabhu’, ghuru, and rato” (father, mother, teacher, and government leader) (Wiyata, 2002). These sex workers are unlikely to get defense and justification for prostitution activities considered wrong and disgraceful by the community. They think there is no point in asking for help from the community, especially religious leaders and community leaders. Instead of the community helping them overcome human rights violations, they will be persecuted and blamed later. Before being disbanded in 2020, in January 2017, the Islamic Defenders Front (FPI), together with Satpol PP officers and the police, carried out a sweep of sex workers in Pamekasan (Berita Metro January 18, 2017, by Harian Berita Metro - Issuu, n.d.).

The story of PSK B describes an incident in 2017 where the FPI organization carried out a sweep and raided the coffee shop it was guarding. According to

Islam, he is aware of the sinful and wrong work, but they must survive with feelings of confusion and despair. She does not want to be insulted by arrogant FPI members, and she wants to be given a solution so she does not work as a sex worker. Ultimately, he could only lament, remain silent, and allow the FPI's treatment. (Prostitute B, 2021). In the picture of PSK D, who has children who study in Islamic boarding schools, he is shaken when he hears FPI members yelling, threatening, and insulting him. He could not do anything; he did not dare complain to the kyai at his son's boarding school. He is ashamed and afraid of being scolded by the kyai if he claims to be a sex worker (PSK D, 2021). PSK A just looked down in shame during the sweeping incident by FPI. She is only afraid of being sent back to her hometown; the economy for the needs of her biological mother and child depends on her (Prostitute A, 2021).

All these sex workers are aware of this sinful work, but they are not mindful of the treatment of these non-state actors as a form of violence and abuse of human rights. They surrender and remain silent without wanting to report to the Satpol PP institution or the police. As a result of this violence, feelings of confusion, humiliation, frustration, and trauma arise. They have a way of dealing with frustration by smoking cigarettes or chatting with loyal clients via cell phone (All Prostitutes, 2021). Among them, some hope that Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) and Muhammadiyah can provide moral, economic, and educational support so that they can escape from this prostitution (Prostitute C, 2021; Prostitute D, 2021).

They also hope that NU will assist in protecting them from violence as the Banser can defend the church (Prostitute B, 2021).

These non-state actors have carried out sweeping as a form of vigilante action. The FPI, which is well-known for its frequent sweeping of prostitution in Indonesia, has displayed a face of violence that spreads threats and fears for sex workers (Wieringa, 2010). FPI, as a group, wants to enforce the law of *makruf nahi munkar* in Indonesia with vigilante behavior (Wilson, 2014), which looks like a street militia (Wilson, 2015).

The Islamic Community Organization NU Pamekasan disapproves of the raid on prostitution practices carried out by FPI because the raid is an authority possessed by government officials (Malidji, NU, 2021). While the Islamic Community Organization of Muhammadiyah Pamekasan understands that there are raids on prostitution practices carried out by FPI to eliminate immoral practices, FPI does not have the authority to carry out charges (Taufik, Muhammadiyah, 2021).

Although it has been disbanded, some residents miss the presence of FPI in the absence of Satpol PP officers in combating prostitution. He feels happy with FPI trying to enforce sharia in Pamekasan, and he feels Pamekasan district, which has the motto Gate Salam (LP2SI, 2010, p. 3), should abolish prostitution in any form. He misses FPI's firmness in fighting immorality, but unfortunately, FPI has been disbanded by the government (TM, Batik Trader, 2021).

The condition of the state or local government, which still does not regulate strictly sex workers, will be directly proportional to the inability of the state to protect sex workers who experience violence. This indecision has become an entry point for FPI to take justice into its own hands in sweeping sex workers. When FPI was disbanded, sweeping activities switched the baton to the 'Lora Madura Community' in Pamekasan to carry out sweeping as FPI did in the past (documentation on the call for action from the 'Lora Madura Community' September 27, 2021).

5. Resistance strategy against violence

The coffee shop keepers always evade being sex workers, although, in the end, they confessed when the Satpol PP officers conducted raids. They admitted that they had surrendered and remained cooperative without a fight when brought to the Satpol PP office. They do this to avoid conditions that will make it more difficult for them. This strategy worked, and they were sent home after answering several questions from Satpol PP officers, so PSK A and PSK F admitted that they had never been included in the social service.

All sex workers admit that if there is a potential client, they talk a lot and ask many questions, then they will pick up a signal that the potential client wants to stop by for coffee or is a spy from Satpol PP and Police officers (Prostitute D, 2021). They are not aggressive in offering sexual services. However, they never feel worried or suspicious of anyone visiting their coffee shop. If it turns

out that this prospective client is an undercover Satpol PP officer, they assume they are experiencing bad luck (Prostitute A, 2021).

Commercial sex workers have no instinct for potential clients. They are dizzy in guessing whether they will experience violence, harassment, or not being paid; the important thing is that they have tried their best to attract potential clients (Prostitute C, 2021). Not dressing up like other commercial sex workers is to avoid being accused by Satpol PP officers if there are raids (Prostitute A, 2021; Prostitute C, 2021; Prostitute F, 2021). These three sex workers admitted that they did not like the appearance of PSK B, who had a different appearance from them, but they never warned PSK B not to dress sexy in a tiger-patterned tight shirt, powder, and thick lipstick (Prostitute A, 2021; Prostitute C, 2021; Prostitute F, 2021).

These sex workers have other strategies for avoiding arrest by raid officers, even though they can no longer develop skills to escape raids. For example, PSK D is resigned to being caught in a charge. However, as an anticipatory measure, he has specific signal codes in case of a raid, such as always holding a cell phone to get information from his loyal client (Prostitute D, 2021). PSK B and PSK C have a habit of memorizing the faces of the Satpol PP officers who usually carry out raid operations (Prostitute B, 2021; Prostitute C, 2021).

D. The courage of sex workers in revealing their experiences of violence

The location of the August 17 market is in the center of the city of Pamekasan, approximately 1.6 km from the Pamekasan regent's pavilion, close to places of education, government agency offices, offices of community organizations, and several Islamic boarding schools. They make establishing these coffee shops a place that generates income for the local economy (Hasan & Azis, 2018, p. 193). However, in subsequent developments, apart from buying food and drinks at the coffee shop, visitors can also get sex services from the coffee shop keepers.

These sex workers should receive the same protection as other legal subjects. However, because of the stigma that they belong to a group of sinners and disruptors of public order, they are reluctant to report the acts of violence they have experienced. It is a form of powerlessness in society. Migrant sex workers are vulnerable to violence and assault while at work (McBride et al., 2020; Rocha-Jiménez et al., 2017). They have minimal options for reporting violence, and sex workers are reluctant to report to the police because of the potential for further arrest or assault (Okal et al., 2011; Platt et al., 2018). They belong to a vulnerable group, and the state should assist in protecting their rights.

This study describes the interaction of sex workers with Satpol PP officers who carry out prostitution raids in Pamekasan Regency. Culturally, their belief in the work of the Satpol PP is the task of the Pamekasan Regency Government that must be carried out so that they do not fight back during

a raid operation. This belief is part of the cultural system in sex workers who carry out their work to fulfill their needs. These female sex workers provide sexual performance, and men buy it. In countries that show a high level of survival orientation, people tend to condemn the practice of prostitution. In contrast, where the values of self-expression prevail, prostitution is more culturally tolerated (Inglehart & Baker, 2000). Meanwhile, Indonesia, which is included in the category of developing countries, is one country that adheres to a cultural system of self-expression.

When sex workers are domiciled in a country where the cultural system of self-expression is still robust by utilizing the syndrome of trust, tolerance, subjective well-being, and political activism, self-expression will thrive on tolerance of individual differences. Patience makes sex workers perceive this job as the best opportunity in the economic field (Simmons, 2017). With a state of tolerance like this, women who are indicated in the practice of prostitution have powerlessness when dealing with raid operations carried out by Satpol PP officers "T".

The raid operations carried out by the Satpol PP officers are already regulated in the Regional Regulation. The possibility of officers acting arbitrarily against sex workers will be minimal, and Satpol PP officers cannot arrest sex workers at will. However, sex workers have experienced that they did not expect, such as when sudden raid operations occur, which can lead to violence. Conditions under the threat of danger make these sex workers make strategic efforts to protect their rights. They need social support from people

they know and those they do not know; they get security services from coffee shop owners, boarding house landlords, hotel admin officers, unscrupulous officers, and community members. They try according to their ability to strategize in avoiding raid operations (Holt et al., 2014).

Every day, they feel anxious and worried about the threat of raid operations. They have several strategies to avoid arrest, such as being cooperative with officers, not dressing up, always holding cellphones, memorizing officers' faces, and capturing environmental and linguistic cues (Clarke, 1997; Dewey & St. Germain, 2014). They can produce and reproduce knowledge disseminated in the environment where they live. The individual experiences shared will help him deal with the law apparatus. Some individuals do not fully understand the accusations against them or how the officers interrogate them, which is a legal and social process (Dewey & St. Germain, 2014).

Sex workers usually continuously monitor whether or not there are raid operations from state actors. They pay attention to their appearance and behavior as a consideration in making decisions to avoid raid operations and minimize the risk of being detected as sex workers. They also comply with State regulations to reduce their visibility as sex workers (Holt et al., 2014). It can be seen how sex workers in Pamekasan carefully monitor whether or not there is any raid operation from Satpol PP officers by relying on informants and environmental cues. In addition, they look normal without showing the thickness of their make-up or clothes with consideration as a way to avoid raid operations

by minimizing the risk of being detected as sex workers. They also comply with PPKM rules during the COVID-19 pandemic to reduce their visibility as sex workers.

When faced with FPI, which presents Islamic narratives in every action, sex workers cannot do much, only be resigned and aware of this sinful job. FPI builds Islamic records that are anti-immorality and then conduct these raids, actually showing their ignorance and their distrust of the authorities owned by the state, which are authorized to deal with violations of public order, including prostitution (Woodward et al., 2014). FPI is a form of vigilantism condemned in the state justice system. On the other hand, NU and Muhammadiyah Pamekasan only expressed their disapproval of FPI's vigilantism, regardless of the fate of sex workers. They hope that Islamic community organizations and their power, support, and networks could determine their life chances. They must be free from violence.

The relationship between sex workers and security teams through social media-based communication on specific platforms and the exchange of information through environmental cues occurs systemically in the prostitution market. Street prostitution appears to be very persistent, inseparable, and widespread in many Cities, Provinces, and Countries and is usually fraught with other dangers arising from the streets (M.S. Scott et al., 2006). Commercial sex workers in Pamekasan could exchange information to avoid raid operations. They felt that this effort had succeeded in minimizing the occurrence of arrests and being detected as sex workers.

Sex workers who successfully resist state and non-state actors through their choice of strategies indicate an effort

to reduce or reject violence from the more dominant state and non-state actors (JC Scott, 1985, p. 295). The resistance to these two actors shows the condition of sex workers who consider themselves victims of injustice (Gurr, 2016, p. 13). Sex workers carry out incidental or epiphenomenal activities. They are disorganized, unsystematic, individual, chancy, and have no revolutionary consequences (J.C. Scott, 1985, p. 292).

E. Conclusions

This article examines the interaction of female Muslim sex workers with state and non-state actors in Madura. This article shows that sex workers are aware of this sinful work, but they cannot accept the violence they experience, so they carry out various strategies of resistance to protect their rights. State actors and non-state actors are not allowed to commit violence against sex workers for social, political, moral, and religious reasons. The narrative shown by sex workers is in the form of hope for the presence of the state and society in eliminating violence, discrimination, and stigmatization against them. Sex workers in Madura do not stop the population, so the state and society must have a program to control and suppress the people, for example, through the diversion of prostitution, which can be seen as a solution to solving social problems while helping sex workers to get out of prostitution. This article encourages other researchers to conduct more research to uncover violence against sex workers perpetrated by state and non-state actors against other vulnerable groups such as transgender, homosexuals, people with HIV/AIDS, disability, and minority groups.

Acknowledgments

The author would like to thank LPPM IAIN Madura for funding this research. We would not forget to thank the sex workers who, with their consent, openness, and involvement, have shared their stories, experiences, and stories in this article. Finally, thanks to the editors who have read this carefully and thoroughly and provided constructive comments to improve this article.

REFERENCES

- Aborisade, R. A. (2019). Police abuse of sex workers in Nigeria: Evidence from a qualitative study. *Police Practice and Research*, 20(4), 405–419. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15614263.2018.1500283>
- Amal, M. K. (2020). Towards a Deliberative Conflict Resolution? A Reflection on State Inclusive Response to Sunni-Shi'a Tension in Indonesia's Democracy. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 8(2), 226. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v8i2.7146>
- Arinta, D., & Zakiah, R. (2017). Kajian Hukum Dan Kebijakan HIV di Indonesia: Sebuah Tinjauan terhadap Peraturan Perundang-Undangan dan Implementasinya di Enam Kota/Kabupaten. *Lembaga Bantuan Hukum Masyarakat*.
- Armstrong, L. (2011). *Managing risks of violence in decriminalized street-based sex work: A feminist (sex worker rights) perspective*.
- Artaria, M. D., & Kinasih, S. E. (2017). Sex-workers in a Country of Largest Muslim Population. *Asian Social Science*, 13(6), 31. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v13n6p31>
- Awaludin, A. (2019). *The Uncertainty of Regulating Online Prostitution in Indonesia*. 332–334. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icglow-19.2019.81>
- Ayu S Joni, I. D., Dewi Pascarani, N. N., & Erviantono, T. (2019). Interaksionisme Simbolik Aparatus Dan Pekerja Seks Di Bali. *Jurnal Inovasi Ilmu Sosial Dan Politik*, 1(2), 96. <https://doi.org/10.33474/jisop.v1i2.4807>
- Barker, J. (2007). Vigilantes and the State. In T. Day (Ed.), *Identifying with Freedom* (1st ed., pp. 87–94). Berghahn Books; JSTOR. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctt1x76f6g.11>

- Barnett, L., & Casavant, Lyne. (2014). *Prostitution: A review of legislation in selected countries*. Library of Parliament.
- Beazley, H. (2015). "I just ate some chili": Identities, bodies and sexual practices of young sex workers in Java. In L. R. Bennett & S. G. Davies (Eds.), *Sex and sexualities in contemporary Indonesia: Sexual politics, diversity, representations and health* (pp. 183–202). London and New York: Routledge.
- Berita Metro 18 Januari 2017 by Harian Berita Metro—* *Issuu*. (n.d.). Retrieved November 5, 2021, from https://issuu.com/harianberitametro/docs/combine_a183da7f062494/10
- Bufacchi, V. (2005). Two Concepts of Violence. *Political Studies Review*, 3(2), 193–204. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1478-9299.2005.00023.x>
- Carspecken, F. P. (2013). *Critical Ethnography in Educational Research* (0 ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315021263>
- Carter, S. (1993). Categories And Terrains Of Exclusion: Constructing The "Indian Woman" In The Early Settlement Era In Western Canada. *Great Plains Quarterly*, 13(3), 147–161. JSTOR.
- Clarke, R. V. (1997). Introduction. In R. V. Clarke (Ed.), *Situational crime prevention: Successful case studies* (2. ed). Criminal Justice Press.
- De Wildt, R. (2016). Ethnographic Research on the Sex Industry: The Ambivalence of Ethical Guidelines. In D. Siegel & R. de Wildt (Eds.), *Ethical Concerns in Research on Human Trafficking* (Vol. 13, pp. 51–69). Springer

International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-21521-1_4

Dewey, S., & St. Germain, T. (2014). "It Depends on the Cop:" Street-Based Sex Workers' Perspectives on Police Patrol Officers. *Sexuality Research and Social Policy*, 11(3), 256–270. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13178-014-0163-8>

Dewey, S., & Zheng, T. (2013). *Ethical research with sex workers: Anthropological approaches*. Springer. https://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4614-6492-1_2

Estimates and Projection of HIV/Aids In Indonesia 2015-2020. (2017). https://Siha.Kemkes.Go.Id/Portal/Files_upload/ESTIMATES_AND_PROJECTION_OF_HIVAIDS_IN_INDONESIA_2015__2020.Pdf.

Febriandi, Y., Ansor, M., & Nursiti, N. (2021). Seeking Justice Through Qanun Jinayat: The Narratives of Female Victims of Sexual Violence in Aceh, Indonesia. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 9(1), 103. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v9i1.8029>

Goodyear, M., & Auger, C. (2013). Regulating women's sexuality: Social movements and internal exclusion. In E. van der Meulen, E. M. Durisin, & V. Love (Eds.), *Selling Sex: Experience, Advocacy, and Research on Sex Work in Canada* (pp. 211–229). UBC Press.

Graaf, R., Vanwesenbeeck, I., Zessen, G., Straver, C., & Visser, J. (1992). Condom use and sexual behavior in heterosexual prostitution in The Netherlands. *AIDS (London, England)*, 6, 1223–1226. <https://doi.org/10.1097/00002030-199210000-00032>

Gurr, T. R. (2016). *Why Men Rebel* (Fortieth anniversary paperback edition). Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group.

- Hammad, H. (2016). *Industrial sexuality: Gender, urbanization, and social transformation in Egypt*. University of Texas Press.
- Harcourt, C., & Donovan, B. (2005). The many faces of sex work. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*, 81(3), 201. <https://doi.org/10.1136/sti.2004.012468>
- Hasan, M., & Azis, M. (2018). *Pembangunan Ekonomi & Pemberdayaan Masyarakat: Strategi Pembangunan Manusia dalam Perspektif Ekonomi Lokal*.
- Hasanurrahman, Mohammad. (2021). Kasi. Penyelidikan dan Penyidikan pada Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja dan Pemadam Kebakaran Kab. Pamekasan
- Holt, T. J., Blevins, K. R., & Kuhns, J. B. (2014). Examining Diffusion and Arrest Avoidance Practices Among Johns. *Crime & Delinquency*, 60, 261–283.
- Honderich, T. (2003). After The Terror: A Book and Further Thoughts. *The Journal of Ethics*, 7(2), 161–181. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1022947208226>
- Hull, T. (2017). From Concubines to Prostitutes. A Partial History of Trade in Sexual Services in Indonesia. *Moussons*, 29, 65–93. <https://doi.org/10.4000/moussons.3771>
- INDONESIA, P. A. I. (2018). *UUMILC 2017 9TH UUM INTERNATIONAL LEGAL CONFERENCE*.
- Inglehart, R., & Baker, W. E. (2000). Modernization, Cultural Change, and the Persistence of Traditional Values. *American Sociological Review*, 65(1), 19. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2657288>
- Irwanto, I., & Praptoraharjo, I. (2014). *Pekerja Seks, Kekerasan dan HIV di Jakarta, Indonesia*. UNFPA dan UNDP.

- Jonge, Huub de. (1990). of bulls and men; The Madurese “aduan sapi.” *Bijdragen Tot de Taal-, Land- En Volkenkunde / Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences of Southeast Asia*, 146(4), 423–447. <https://doi.org/10.1163/22134379-90003209>
- Kay Hoang, K. (2010). Economies of emotion, familiarity, fantasy, and desire: Emotional labor in Ho Chi Minh City’s sex industry. *Sexualities*, 13(2), 255–272. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1363460709359224>
- Kholifah, E. (2016). *Prostitusi Masih Tetap Ada, Studi Fenomenologis Ambiguitas Individu Birokrat Lapangan dalam Implementasi Kebijakan*. LPPM Universitas Muhammadiyah Jember Press.
- Kingston, S. (2013). *Prostitution in the community* (0 ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315883991>
- LP2SI, T. (2010). Mengenal Gerbang Salam. *Pamekasan: LP2SI*.
- Malidji, Mahrus Ali. (2021). *Wakil Ketua* Pengurus Cabang *Nahdlatul Ulama Pamekasan*.
- Mattson, G. (2015). The modern career of ‘the oldest profession’ and the social embeddedness of metaphors. *American Journal of Cultural Sociology*, 3(2), 191–223. <https://doi.org/10.1057/ajcs.2015.4>
- McBride, B., Shannon, K., Bingham, B., Braschel, M., Strathdee, S., & Goldenberg, S. M. (2020). Underreporting of violence to police among women sex workers in Canada: Amplified inequities for immigrant and in-call workers before and following end-demand legislation. *Health and Human Rights*, 22(2), 257.

- Merry, S. E. (2016). *The seductions of quantification: Measuring human rights, gender violence, and sex trafficking*. The University of Chicago Press.
- Murray, A. J. (1987). *No money no honey: A study of street traders and prostitutes in Jakarta*. 203 p. <https://doi.org/10.25911/5D690A4F2D94F>
- Observasi. (2021). Observasi terhadap pekerja seks yang dilakukan pada kurun waktu Maret 2021 hingga Oktober 2021
- Okal, J., Chersich, M. F., Tsui, S., Sutherland, E., Temmerman, M., & Luchters, S. (2011). Sexual and physical violence against female sex workers in Kenya: A qualitative inquiry. *AIDS Care*, 23(5), 612–618. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540121.2010.525605>
- Panggabean, S. R., Alam, R. H., & Fauzi, I. A. (2010). The Patterns of Religious Conflict In Indonesia (1990-2008). *Studia Islamika*, 17(2). <https://doi.org/10.15408/sdi.v17i2.461>
- Peraturan-Peraturan Daerah tentang Pelacuran*. (2021). https://peraturan.go.id/peraturan/index-daerah.html?DaerahSearch%5Bdaerah_hun%5D=&DaerahSearch%5Btentang%5D=pelacuran
- Platt, L., Grenfell, P., Meiksin, R., Elmes, J., Sherman, S. G., Sanders, T., Mwangi, P., & Crago, A.-L. (2018). Associations between sex work laws and sex workers' health: A systematic review and meta-analysis of quantitative and qualitative studies. *PLOS Medicine*, 15(12), e1002680. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.1002680>.

- Putusan Pengadilan Negeri Padang.* (2021). <https://putusan3.mahkamahagung.go.id/direktori/index/pengadilan/pn-padang/kategori/ite-1.html>
- Reitman, B. L. (1936). *The Second Oldest Profession: A Study of The Prostitute's "Business Manager."* Constable.
- Rigotti, C. (2021). When the law meets feminisms: The shortcomings of contemporary prostitution policies across the European Union. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 86, 102467. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2021.102467>
- Rocha-Jiménez, T., Brouwer, K. C., Silverman, J. G., Morales-Miranda, S., & Goldenberg, S. M. (2017). Exploring the Context and Implementation of Public Health Regulations Governing Sex Work: A Qualitative Study with Migrant Sex Workers in Guatemala. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 19(5), 1235–1244. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10903-016-0399-x>
- Scheper-Hughes, N., & Bourgois, P. (2004). Introduction: Making sense of violence. *Violence in War and Peace: An Anthology*, 4.
- Scott, J. C. (1985). *Weapons of the weak: Everyday forms of peasant resistance.* Yale University Press.
- Scott, M. S., Dedel, K., United States, Department of Justice, & Office of Community Oriented Policing Services. (2006). *Street prostitution.* U.S. Dept. of Justice, Office of Community Oriented Policing Services.
- Sidibé, M. (2018). UNAIDS Data 2018. *UNAIDS. Đường Link: Http://Www. Unaid. Org/Sites/Default/Files/Media_asset/Unaid-Data-2018_en. Pdf.*

- Simmons, D. G. (2017). *Labor of Love: Prostitutes and Civic Engagement in Leadville, Colorado, 1870-1915*.
- Sinha, S. (2017). Ethical and Safety Issues in Doing Sex Work Research: Reflections From a Field-Based Ethnographic Study in Kolkata, India. *Qualitative Health Research*, 27(6), 893–908. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732316669338>
- Sugianto, Agus. (2021). Kepala Unit Penyidik pada unit Perlindungan Perempuan dan Anak Polres Pamekasan.
- Sukandar, Moh. (2021). Kasi. Pembinaan, Pengawasan dan Penyuluhan pada Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja dan Pemadam Kebakaran Kab. Pamekasan.
- Surratt, H. L., Kurtz, S. P., Weaver, J. C., & Inciardi, J. A. (2005). The Connections of Mental Health Problems, Violent Life Experiences, and the Social Milieu of the “Stroll” with the HIV Risk Behaviors of Female Street Sex Workers. *Journal of Psychology & Human Sexuality*, 17(1–2), 23–44. https://doi.org/10.1300/J056v17n01_03
- Suyanto, B., Hidayat, M. A., & Wadipalapa, R. P. (2020). Sexual exploitation and violence of prostituted children. *Masyarakat, Kebudayaan Dan Politik*, 33(2), 134–145. <http://dx.doi.org/10.20473/mkp.V33I22020.134-145>
- Taufik, Daeng Ali. (2021). *Ketua Pimpinan Daerah Muhammadiyah Pamekasan*.
- Thrift, N. J. (1983). On the determination of social action in space and time. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 1(1), 23–57. <https://doi.org/10.1068/d010023>
- TM, Pedagang Batik. (2021). Pedagang Batik yang berjualan di Pasar 17 Agustus Pamekasan.

- Wieringa, S. E. (2010). Gender Variance in Asia: Discursive Contestations and Legal Implications. *Gender, Technology and Development*, 14(2), 143–172. <https://doi.org/10.1177/097185241001400202>
- Williamson, C., Baker, L., Jenkins, M., & Cluse-Tolar, T. (2007). Police-Prostitute Interactions: Sometimes Discretion, Sometimes Misconduct. *Journal of Progressive Human Services*, 18(2), 15–37. https://doi.org/10.1300/J059v18n02_03
- Wilson, I. (2014). Morality Racketeering: Vigilantism and Populist Islamic Militancy in Indonesia. In K. B. Teik, V. R. Hadiz, & Y. Nakanishi (Eds.), *Between Dissent and Power* (pp. 248–274). Palgrave Macmillan UK. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137408808_12
- Wilson, I. (2015). *ISEAS Perspective: Watching the Indonesian Elections 2014* (U. Fionna, Ed.; pp. 32–40). ISEAS Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1355/9789814620840-007>
- Wiyata, A. L. (2002). *Carok; Konflik Kekerasan & Harga Diri Orang Madura*. Lkis Pelangi Aksara.
- Wolffers, I. (1999). Pacar and Tamu: Indonesian women sex workers' relationships with men. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 1(1), 39–53. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369105993011157>
- Woodward, M., Yahya, M., Rohmaniyah, I., Coleman, D. M., Lundry, C., & Amin, A. (2014). The Islamic Defenders Front: Demonization, Violence and the State in Indonesia. *Contemporary Islam*, 8(2), 153–171. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11562-013-0288-1>

World Health Organization. (2013). Addressing violence against sex workers. *Implementing Comprehensive HIV/STI Programmes with Sex Workers: Practical Approaches from Collaborative Interventions*, 19–39.