Islamic Education Politics: Ambiguity of Policy Intepretation in Islamic Higher Education

Muhammad Miftah

Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Kudus, Indonesia Doctoral Program Student of the State Islamic University of Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia muhammadmiftah@stainkudus.ac.id

Abstract

The superior development priority of Human Resources (HR) is the answer to the twisted development of the Industrial Revolution Era 4.0 which is currently booming. Increasing the competitiveness of the Indonesian people through education is a logical and philosophical argument; which the demographic bonus that Indonesia has in 2020 more than 67% of the Indonesian population is in productive ages. Islamic Religious College is one of the locomotives that is believed to be able to deliver its demographic bonus in accordance with the Strategic Plan owned by the Indonesian. This opportunity has also been captured by the education world with the issuance of the Indonesian Qualification Framework (Kerangka Kualifikasi Nasional Indonesia, KKNI) policy and strategic policies issued by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education (Kementerian Riset, Teknologi, dan Pendidikan Tinggi) and the Ministry of Religion (Kementerian Agama) in welcoming the rapid development. The policy product resulted by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education and the Ministry of Religion at the upstream level has the same goal, but at the grassroots downstream level the policy implementation in each of Islamic Higher Education (Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam, PTKI) is very dynamic and sometimes also contradictory to the policies of this institution. The focus of this research is to examine the contradictory realities in implementing interrelated policies in various Islamic Religious Colleges using a qualitative approach. The findings of this research can be concluded that dynamics, contradictions in the policies implementation in various PTKIs due to social conditions, campus politics, academic culture and the authority leader who lead a university, become a trigger for multiple interpretations of a policy product.

Keywords: College Policy, Negosiation, Institution Authority.

Abstrak

POLITIK PENDIDIKAN ISLAM: AMBIGUITAS TAFSIR KEBIJAKAN DI PERGURUAN TINGGI KEAGAMAAN ISLAM. Prioritas pembangunan Sumber Daya Manusia (SDM) vang unggul merupakan jawaban atas geliat perkembangan Era Revolusi Industri 4.0 yang sedang booming akhir-akhir ini. Peningkatan daya saing bangsa Indonesia melalui jalur pendidikan merupakan argumentasi yang logis dan filosofis, mengingat bonus demografi yang dimiliki Indonesia pada 2020 lebih dari 67% dari populasi masyarakat Indonesia berada di usia produktif. Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam (PTKI) menjadi salah satu lokomotif yang dipercaya dapat mengantarkan bonus demografi yang dimilikinya sesuai dengan Rencana Strategis yang dimilki bangsa Indonesia. Peluang ini pun ditangkap dunia pendidikan dengan dikeluarkannya kebijakan Kerangka Kualifikasi Nasional Indonesia (KKNI) serta kebijakan-kebijakan strategis yang dikeluarkan Kementerian Riset, Teknologi, dan Pendidikan Tinggi dan Kementerian Agama dalam menyongsong pesatnya perkembangan yang ada. Produk kebijakan yang dikeluarkan Kementerian Riset, Teknologi, dan Pendidikan Tinggi dan Kementerian Agama dalam tataran hulu memiliki tujuan yang sama, namun dalam tataran hilir implementasi kebijakan di masing-masing Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam (PTKI) sangat dinamis dan kadang pula kontradiktif dengan kebijakan yang menaungi lembaga ini. Fokus riset ini membedah realitas yang kontradiktif dalam implementasi kebijakan yang berkelindan di pelbagai Perguruan Tinggi Agama Islam dengan menggunakan

pendekatan kualitatif. Temuan riset ini menyimpulkan bahwa dinamisasi dan kontradiksi dalam implementasi kebijakan yang muncul di pelbagai PTKI disebabkan keadaan sosial, politik kampus, kultur akademik, dan *leader of authority* yang menahkodai suatu perguruan tinggi. Hal ini menjadi pemicu multitafsir akan suatu produk kebijakan.

Kata Kunci: Kebijakan Perguruan Tinggi, Negosiasi, Otoritas Kelembagaan.

A. Introduction

The embryo of the university development in Indonesia has begun since the Dutch colonial era, estimated since the 1900s; the goal of establishing university institutions by the Dutch was nothing more than a political program hidden by the Dutch, namely ethical politics¹ rather than the good goal of educating Indegeneous society.² In historical records, the first Islamic College was established in Padang, initiated by the Association of Islamic Teachers (Persatuan Guru-guru Agama Islam, PGAI) in Minangkabau (Padang) led by Mahmud Yunus in 1940.³ While the emergence of State Islamic University Institution (Perguruan Tinggi Agama Islam Negeri, PTAIN) cannot be separated from Indonesian Islamic University (Universitas Islam Indonesia, UII), the presence of PTAIN in the constellation of Islamic higher education in Indonesia is the most

¹Ethical Politics or also called the reciprocity politics in Dutch is known as Ethische Politiek is an idea that states that the Dutch Colonial government holds moral control and responsibility for the welfare of the society. This thinking is the answer to *tanam paksa* politics. This ethical policy was pioneered by Pieter Brooshooft, see also Baudet and Brugsman, *Politik Etis dan Revolusi Kemerdekaan* (Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia, 1987), 187.

²Bappenas, Laporan Kajian Pendanaan Pendidikan Tinggi di Indonesia (Jakarta: Bappenas, 2010), 25.

³The High School was officially opened on December 9, 1940, consisting of two Faculties, the Sharia Faculty (Religion) and the Faculty of Education and Arabic. The existence of this Islamic High School did not last for more or less two years, precisely in March 1942 the license for the operation of the Islamic High School had to be closed due to Dutch political policies which only allowed Islamic Schools at the basic stage only, Mahmud Yunus, *Sejarah Pendidikan Islam di Indonesia* (Jakarta: Hidakarya, 1996), 278-280.

important part in developing Islamic higher education. Therefore, on August 12, 1950 it became the early history of the PTAIN emergence, where the religious faculties under UII management were separated and taken over by the government in order to strengthen the higher education development. Finally, on September 26, 1951 a new college was officially opened under the name of PTAIN which was directly under the supervision of the Ministry of Religion of the Indonesia Republic.⁴

The history of PTAIN is a continuation of the UII religion faculty. This means that PTAIN does not stand alone without a strong background. This indicates that Islamic college in Indonesia experience dynamics along with the society development and the Muslims needs. PTAIN was founded in Yogyakarta in 1951 with Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 34 Tahun 1950 and signed by the President of the Indonesia Republic on August 14, 1950. PTAIN came from the UII religious faculty. Thus UII no longer has a religious faculty. Only the law faculty, economics faculty and pedagogic faculty (education) are left.⁵ This is the forerunner to the emergence of Islamic Higher Education (Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam, PTKI) in Indonesia.

At this time, Islamic Higher Education especially State Islamic Institute (Institut Agama Islam Negeri, IAIN) and State Islamic College (Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Negeri, STAIN) have been and are being faced with major and fundamental problems. This issue concerns the output that has not been adequately accommodated (involved), and not maximally into various aspects of the modern life needs.⁶ Historically the position of Islamic college began to be taken into account since the conversion of IAIN to State Islamic

⁴Amirudin, "Dinamika Lembaga Pendidikan Tinggi di Indonesia", *Jurnal MIQOT* 41, no. 1 (2017): 98-117.

⁵Amirudin, 98-117.

⁶Saifullah, "Reformulasi Paradigma Kajian Keislaman di Perguruan Tinggi Agama Islam (PTAI)", *Edukasia: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan* 10, no. 2 (2012): 201.

University (Universitas Islam Negeri, UIN), the institutional change of IAIN Svarif Hidavatulullah Jakarta changed to the State Islamic University, then followed by IAIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta and STAIN Malang.7 Then it is also followed by IAIN Alauddin Makasar, IAIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, and IAIN Syarif Kasim Pekanbaru Riau to be UIN.8 Up to now the number of PTKIN in Indonesia has reached 58 institutions consisting of 17 UIN, 34 IAIN, and 17 STAIN. The challenge of Islamic universities today is not only to produce Muslim scholars who master religious knowledge, but more than that as the development of science and technology today, society is faced with a new instantaneous civilization. Like the community's consideration in choosing college based on economic pragmatic reasons, this certainly is not necessarily wrong, because seeing the reality of free market competition which is increasingly hard, it is necessary to emphasize the importance of college autonomy again,⁹ in order to be able to solve the increasingly more complex problems.

Therefore the management of college must be able to answer the demands and challenges of a very dynamic environmental change.¹⁰ The current condition of our Islamic Higher Education (read: PTKI/N) globally can be said to be still far from expectations if we compare it with the performance of the State General Universities (Perguruan Tinggi Umum Negeri, PTUN). This fact

⁷Sulistiowati Irianto, *Otonomi Perguruan Tinggi: Suatu Keniscayaan* (Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia, 2012), 63.

⁸Sutrisno, Pembaharuan Pengembangan Pendidikan Islam (Yogyakarta: Fadilatama, 2011), 87.

⁹The long history of university autonomy in the history course evidently has been thought by the founding fathers of Indonesian education. On August 4th to 6th August 1947 of education congress in Surakarta attended by Ki Hajar Dewantara, Prof. Soepomo, Prof. Soenario Kolopaking, and President Soekarno have discussed the autonomy of university, so that universities have their own autonomy in managing and developing their potential. See Sulistiowati Irianto, *Otonomi Perguruan Tinggi: Suatu Keniscayaan*, 99.

¹⁰Iskandar Agung and Agus Santoso, "Dinamika LPTK Menuju Perguruan Tinggi Kelas Dunia (World Class University/WCU)", *Perspektif Ilmu Pendidikan* 31, no. 1 (2017): 42–54.

can be seen from the low performance or performance of various aspects such as competitiveness, market absorption of scholars due to the low quality of outputs, low raw-input, content and learning process quality, facilities and infrastructure quality, funding and other indicators as required as it has been established by the National Education Standards Agency (Badan Nasional Standar Pendidikan, BNSP).¹¹ It is indeed not easy to solve the problems of our colleges organization threads; it needs an in-depth study of various aspects to examine this problem. In this research, the researcher has the hypothesis that the failure of Islamic higher education implementation is strongly influenced by several factors. Among the most dominant factors in influencing the success of Islamic Higher Education is the PTKI position which still "hesitantly" positions itself under the two authorities between the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education¹² and the Ministry of Religion.

Two authorities (the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education and the Ministry of Religion) that oversee Islamic Higher Education are the causes of the Islamic Higher Education limited "space" to consider under the authorities auspices who sometimes have overlapping policies. In addition, the policies issued by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education as protectors for the Ministry of Religion in designing policies at Islamic Higher Education which sometimes the policies do not accommodate the expected needs of Islamic Higher Education, finally there is "confusion" in implementing the policy because Islamic Higher Education refers to two policy products that copes this institution.

¹¹Masdar Hilmy, Pendidikan Islam dan Tradisi Ilmiah (Malang: Madani, 2016), 45.

¹²The Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education is a ministry that was born in the leadership era of President Joko Widodo 2014-2019 which is a merger between the Ministry of Research and Technology with Higher Education which was previously under the government of the Ministry of Education and Culture. While in the second period, the Higher Education nomenclature again became the authority of the Ministry of Education and Culture which was led by Nadiem Makarim.

This paper will only focus on policy products issued by the Ministry of Religion in terms of Islamic Religious Colleges Development and how they are implemented in the field and the surround dynamics, including: *First*, why there are differences in the implementation of policies in various Islamic Religious Colleges. *Second*, how the social dynamics that occur in the field with the reality of the policies implemented in Islamic College is.

In this research as a surgical tool the author uses Michel Foucault's power theory. He said that power is never separated from knowledge. Power and knowledge influence each other. There is no relationship of power without the formation associated with the knowledge.¹³ Karl Max considered that power is only belonged to the upper classes, also dominated and monopolized by bourgeoisie. This is also strengthened by Thomas Hobbes's view who interpreted that power only belongs to the institution called the State and the State has absolute power to determine its societies' lives.¹⁴ But this is different from Foucault's view in discussing the relationship of power and subjects. Power is not a structure, neither is an institution, nor is the power possessed, but power in Foucault's view is a name that is placed on a complex strategic network in a society.¹⁵

Foucult's views on knowledge and power give reciprocity each other and the discourse has an ideological function, knowledge and power go in the direction of a historic and specific power regime. Therefore, every society runs its truth pattern which has regulation and normalization.¹⁶ Power requires knowledge forms as dimensions to shape the social reality they describe. In this reality, power and knowledge have direct implications for each other, while relationships between social actors always form a knowledge arena.¹⁷

¹³Haryatmoko, Etika Politik dan Kekuasaan (Jakarta: Kompas, 2003), 54.

¹⁴F. Budi Hardiman, Filsafat Modern (Jakarta: Gramedia, 2007), 67.

¹⁵Haryatmoko, *Etika Politik dan Kekuasaan*, 223.

¹⁶Michel Foucault, *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977*, ed. C. Gordon (Bringhton: Harvester, 1980), 52.

¹⁷Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punish: the Birth of the Prison*, trans. A. Sheridan (Harmonsworth: Peregrine, 1977), 28.

Wherever there is power, there is resistance. In this case, resistance is not only meant by opposing forces, but resistance arises from within the power itself. Resistance can be interpreted as contrariness, defiance, rejection of existing discourse. Foucault transforms the power that confessionally known as an oppressive thing and in its development it will create knowledge and eventually become a discourse.¹⁸ If we use Foucault's thought in education discourse, it can be illustrated that Foucault offers a perspective and methodological foothold to learn education that is a humanities part with a focus on relations between power and knowledge, which subjects becomes knowledge object, then object and power are connected to contribute on the development of existing discourse.¹⁹ If it is compared to the political theory of Deborah Norden²⁰ in facing power because College is part of Civil Society, there are at least two model that can be used: First, competitive model is good model, means it uses the legal norms and mechanism in controlling the rulling policy. Second, colutive model is that College and Ruler have a special closeness so that there is a reluctance to criticize all existing policies, a model like this is only "sami'na wa atha'na" and only follow the existing authorities.²¹

Besides Foucault's theory, this research also uses policy implementation theory of Brian W. Hogwood and Lewis A. Gunn. It is the theory that is used in implementing policy by "he top down approach" to implementate the policy perfectly (perfect implementation).²² And, also the theory of Van Meter and Van Horn

¹⁸Foucault, Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977, 119. ¹⁹George Ritzer and Douglas J Goodman, Teori Sosisologi: dari Sosiologi Klasik sam-

pai Perkembangan Mutakhir Teori Sosial Postmodern (Yogyakarta: Keasi Wacana, 2010), 655.

²⁰Deborah L Norden, "The Policies and Politics of Control: Countering Argentina's Uniformed and Unemployed Protesters", *Journal Latin American Politics and Society* 53, no. 3 (2011): 83-114.

²¹Hamdan Daulay, "Diskusi Kebangsaan XXIV: Demokrasi dalam Politik Transaksional, Catatan Kegalauan Tentang Pegamalan Pancasila Dewasa Ini", *Warta Kebangsaan Nusantara dan Dunia*, Paguyuban Wartawan Sepuh.

²²B.W. Hogwood and L.A. Gunn, *Policy Analysis for the Real World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1984), 185.

that asking about why there are the failed policy implementation and the successful policy implementation. In his view, the success of policy implementation is influenced by the policy and policy performance itself.²³ This theory is used to solve the failure and success of the implemented policy in College, and what factors influence it and how the practice of policy implementation.

This is actually not the first study and research about education policy. There are many previous researches about education policy. But there are some problems of the previous research that makes the writer wants to solve. In addition, the literature review is done in order to differentiate and positioning in the research. The researches about the education policy are Choirul Mahfud,²⁴

Mohammad Emnis Anwar,²⁵ Abdul Aziz,²⁶ Wildani Hefni,²⁷ Azyumardi Azra,²⁸ Hasniyati Gani Ali,²⁹ and Asad Muzamil.³⁰

Compared to the previous researches which did not study specifically about the policy authority in Islamic College, this research gives building pattern, position, and PTKI/N part in delivering the policy to the policy implementation in Islamic Higher Education.

²³Solichin Abdul Wahab, *Analisis Kebijaksanaan: dari Formulasi ke Implementasi Kebijaksanaan Negara* (Jakarta: Burni Aksara, 1997), 38.

²⁴Choirul Mahfud, *Politik Pendidikan Islam: Analisis Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam Pasca Orde Barn* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2016).

²⁵Mohammad Emnis Anwar, "Menelusuri Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam di Indonesia", *Edukasi Islami: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 5 (2017).

²⁶Abdul Aziz, "Memperkuat Kebijakan Negara dalam Penanggulangan Radikalisme di Lembaga Pendidikan", *Hikmah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 12, no. 1 (2016): 29-58.

²⁷Wildani Hefni, "Kebijakan Politik dalam Pengembangan Tradisi Akademik Intelektual Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam", *Akademika: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 23, no. 1 (2018): 107-28.

²⁸Azyumardi Azra, "Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam di Era Otonomi Daerah", *Edukasi: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan* 2, no. 2 (2017).

²⁹St. Hasniyati Gani Ali, "Kebijakan Pemerintah terhadap Pembinaan Pendidikan Islam", *Al-Ta'dib* 8, no. 2 (2015): 99-110.

³⁰As'ad Muzammil, "Kebijakan Pemerintah dalam Bidang Pendidikan: dari Orde Lama sampai Orde Baru (Suatu Tinjauan Historis)", *Potensia* 2, no. 2 (2016): 183-98.

B. Discussion

1. Dualism of Policy Authority in Religious Colleges

Undang-undang Nomor 20 Tahun 1961 about College gives a chance to every region to have minimally one state university. The law instructs each province to have at least one state university in response to the community's need for college. Besides in the law, the community was given the authority to develop higher education independently by establishing private colleges.³¹ The education actors use the basis of this law as a foothold to compete in establishing college, as well as Muslim scholars practice in those days.

Islamic college institutions are the further education institutions of high school level, which is under the Ministry of Religion. Its existence is expected to embody Islamic teachings and values in their educational activities. So that the results of Islamic Higher Education in the form of added value of the students subject, have different importance levels between the students subject himself as the main user of the education results, as parents as the second user, the labor market as the third user.³² Bachelor in Mukti Ali's view is not only related to his academic degree, but also a scholar must have several criteria including emphasizing the work of the mind, critical of the circumstances around both religion, social and culture that develops in society.³³

The new problem coming to our education world is the emergence of ambiguity about goal setting which our education system wants to achieve through the existence policy product. The real description of this product is the presence of mechanic student type that every student is oriented to the market development not

³¹Galih R.N. Putra, *Politik Pendidikan: Liberalisasi Pendidikan Tinggi di Indonesia dan India* (Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia, 2016), 62-63.

³²Muhammad Fathurrohman and Sulistiorini, *Implementasi Manajemen Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Islam* (Yogyakarta: Teras, 2012), 134.

³³Mukti Ali, Beberapa Masalah Pendidikan di Indonesia (Yogyakarta: Yayasan Nida, 1971), 12.

to the scientific orientation and student talent.³⁴ If I might illustrate that our education goal this time is depends on the sorrounds social and world development as the consequence of interaction between the realities of education and the real world.

Seen from the policy perspective, Islamic colleges loses ground because of some factors such as: *First*, the implementation of national college is done in a bureaucratically and centralistically, so that the policies issued are not necessarily the same as the each university conditions. *Second*, college policy uses an inconsistent educational production function or input output. *Third*, the community role to the college is only about financial support, input on the college development is still very minimal.³⁵

The long history of Islamic Higher Education was initially established with various limitations. Over time, there have been many policies issued by the government in the context of improving the quality and relevance of Islamic Higher Education. The policy was confirmed by various affirmative actions of the Ministry of Religion of the Indonesia Republic.³⁶ Not only the Ministry of Religion regulate and design the future image for Islamic Higher Education under the Ministry of Religion, but the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education also has the same authority, even exceeds the the Ministry of Religion's authority itself in managing its college.

As a real example of strategic policies in Islamic Higher Education human resources development should refer to the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education policy products as a foothold in developing college generally. Lecturer certification policy further development of lecturer human resources is done by

³⁴Anwar, "Menelusuri Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam di Indonesia", 483.

³⁵Abdul Rohman Shaleh, *Madrasah dan Pendidikan Anak Bangsa* (Jakarta: Raja Grafindo, 2004), 139.

³⁶Hefni, "Kebijakan Politik dalam Pengembangan Tradisi Akademik Intelektual Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam", 109.

Muhammad Miftah

lecturer certification program (Sertifikasi Dosen). Implementation of lecturer certification at Islamic Higher Education still refers to the mechanism imposed by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education procedures and national format of the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education lecturer certification, both in terms of instruments, mechanisms, priority mapping of lecturers to be certified portfolio test, and etc. Although referring to the mechanism of the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education, the Ministry of Religion has its own distinction in the lecturers' certification process in their environment. In 2018 the Ministry of Religion included the National Islamic Insight (Wawasan Islam dan Kebangsaan, WIK) in one of the assessment process elements of lecturer certification. The whole system is done online and uses an application with the page http://serdos.diktis.id, which lecturer certification participant and the admin of proposing college have their own accounts.

The National Islamic Insight instrument which is used as one of the lecturer certification assessment instruments aims to filter and develop lecturers in their understanding of Islam and nationality, and an effort to strengthen Islamic moderation within Islamic Higher Education environment. It is also as a shield to protect the distorted understanding of Islamic Higher Education academics along with the freedom of Islamic Higher Education academics which developed in the democracy and disruption era today. The ideas of radicalism and anti-nationalism often appear among academics.

In developing Islamic Higher Education human resources, in this case lecturer certification, Islamic Higher Education indirectly follows the the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education's policies. The authority of Islamic Higher Education can only provide variety in the selection process such as the addition of national insight instruments that it has done, but overall control over this lecturer certification policy is fully owned by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education.

Policy to strengthen management knowledge³⁷ through the scientific journals accreditation, even this policy is independently managed by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education as writen in Peraturan Menteri Riset, Teknologi, dan Pendidikan Tinggi Nomor 9 Tahun 2018. This regulation states that each journal must be registered in electronic accreditation through the National Journal Accreditation portal (http://arjuna.ristekdikti. go.id). Submission of scientific journals accreditation according to this regulation has been started from June 2018 by using an accreditation ranking system, from first rank of 1st Sinta to 6th Sinta. This policy is indeed very effective in accommodating various journals in national universities including universities under the Ministry of Religion. However, the Ministry of Religion role in this case the Directorate of Islamic Religious Higher Education is only a "manager" to this policy because it does not have the authority.

Institutional policy in managing one of the college tridarma in the form of journals is the main step in the knowledge management flow. Indicators of knowledge management flow can be seen from the development of journal reputation in every college.³⁸ Unfortunately the Ministry of Religion in journal management is only limited to providing encouragement and rewards for journal managers to be able to accredit their journals according to existing regulations. In this case the Ministry of Religion takes steps to optimize its role in the journals management through a special journals academic portal

³⁷Even though Knowledge Management is not exactly like a consulting firm, business colleges are also knowledge that will become science. This is the college product which becomes the superior and strength of each university as a distinctive asset compared to other universities. See also Syahrizal Abbas, *Manajemen Perguruan Tinggi* (Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group, 2009), 104.

³⁸Muhammad Munadi, Fetty Ernawati, and Hakiman Hakiman, "The Reality of Knowledge Management in Islamic Higher Education", *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 7, no. 2 (2018): 225-37

within the scope of Islamic Higher Education namely Moraref indexation. However Moraref here is only limited to the indexation system which has no significant influence in the accreditation process managed by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education. This has become jealousy for journal managers in Islamic Higher Education all over Indonesia.

So in this case it can be concluded that educational institutions that are managed through a centralized system, with a top-down approach, namely educational institutions made as subordinates to a government institution, tend to grow with a high level of dependence on institutions that shelter and blunt their creativity.³⁹ This is also felt by Islamic Higher Education in every program. It must not be in conflict with the policies of the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education both in terms of regulation and in the implementation realm which copes Islamic Higher Education, both financially and adsmitatively.

Various ways were made to minimize the "double face" of Islamic Higher Education by translating the policies issued of the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education into regulations issued by the Ministry of Religion, but efforts to integrate it have not yet reached satisfying. Some concepts have been offered but still leave a problem in the form of dualism policies of Islamic Higher Education.⁴⁰

2. Policy of Islamic Higher Education

Educational policy usually becomes a part of public policy. This paradigm is accepted by the education practitioners. Like it or not, educational policies here are considered the same as the power aspirations or political aspirations of the authorities.⁴¹ Legal policies

³⁹Sulistiowati Irianto, Otonomi Perguruan Tinggi: Suatu Keniscayaan, 18.

⁴⁰Andi Wahyono, "Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam: Hibridasi Lembaga Pendidikan Tinggi", *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 1 (2014): 115-34.

⁴¹H.A.R. Tilaar and Riant Nugroho, *Kebijakan Pendidikan* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2012), 91.

will affect the society's mindset. In this context, a college policy that does not mandate the college implementation according to the community's needs, the college institution will also argue that the state or more specifically the government does not provide policies related to it.⁴²

Based on the exist policy, it needs a reconstruction of college policy in the future in a policy making process about.⁴³ Talking about the existence and role of college in globalization era, there are two dimensions that are closely related, those are localism and globalism. It is impossible to build a college institution without fixing the quality and institutional education in our country. So that in talking about college mission is always related to the analysis about local dimension and then developing its global dimension.⁴⁴

In the last five years, there have been several strategic policies issued by the Ministry of Religion in the development and strengthening Islamic Higher Education, such as can be seen in the following table.

Table 1	

Government Policy in Education

No.	Policy Product	Content	Discussion
1	Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 55 Tahun 2014	Research and community service at Islamic Higher Education.	Research purpose, contents, methods, and outputs.

⁴²Abdullah Fikri, "Partisipasi Politik Masyarakat Difabel dalam Pembentukan Kebijakan Pendidikan Tinggi Inklusif", *Inklusi* 1, no. 1 (2014): 109-28.

⁴³Fikri.

⁴⁴Samsi Pomalingo, "Perguruan Tinggi dan Transformasi Nilai-nilai Islam dalam Konteks Sosial-Budaya Masyarakat Indonesia", *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun* 2, no. 3 (2014): 123.

2	Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 68	Appointment and dismissal of Rector and	Regarding the appointment rules
	Tahun 2015	Chairman at Islamic Higher Education.	and mechanism for selecting the Rector and Chairman at Islamic Higher Education.
3	Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017	Lecturer working hours.	Regulates the working hours of lecturers from the positions of Expert Assistant (asisten Ahli), Chancellor (Lektor), Chief Chancellor (Lektor Kepala), and Professor (Guru Besar).
4	Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 7 Tahun 2018	Standard unit operating costs at Islamic Higher Education.	College funding and operations.
5	Keputusan Direktur Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Nomor 6165 Tahun 2018	Graduates competency standards and learning outcomes graduates of Master and Doctoral Study Programs.	Competency standards that must be owned by Master and Doctoral graduates in Islamic Higher Education.
6	Keputusan Direktur Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Nomor 3069 Tahun 2018	Technical guidance on establishing, amending, dismissing, and revoking licenses of Private Islamic Higher Education.	Technical establishment of college and threats for the college management which is not according to the rules.
7	Surat Edaran No.: B-3192/dj.1/ KP.00.3/09/2019	Functional position and impasing of non- permanent lecturer (dosen non-Pegawai Negeri Sipil, PNS) at Islamic Higher Education.	Promotion of non- permanent lecturer functions in Islamic Higher Education.

8	Keputusan Direktur Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Nomor 3121 Tahun 2019	Provisions for the lecturers transfer and transfer of non-lecturer staffs to functional lecturers.	Rules for lecturer mutation and transfer of non- lecturer staffs to functional lecturers.
9	Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 11 Tahun 2019	About lecturer performance allowances at Islamic Higher Education.	Regulation on payment of performance allowances for permanent lecturer (dosen Pegawai Negeri Sipil, PNS) at Islamic Higher Education.

Islamic Education Politics: Ambiguity of Policy Intepretation in Islamic ...

The policy products issued by the Ministry of Religion in the field of Islamic Higher Education on the table are not completely included in the data. The policy data in the table above is at least a policy that is often debated lately and raises the pros and cons of implementation at Islamic Higher Education level.

3. Negosiation and Institutions Authority in Implementing Islamic Higher Education Policy

In an increasingly open and integrated world, competition has become a major necessity of the college subsector.⁴⁵ The information and globalization flow are two inseparable sides, that is, both have an extraordinary influence in social life, both the positive and negative impacts that exist in life together. The rapid development of the globalization world has resulted an inevitable world restructuring.⁴⁶ This is also felt by universities to follow the pattern of technological development that is increasingly advanced

⁴⁵Laura M. Portnoi, *Higher Education, Policy, and the Global Competition Phenomenon* (Los Angeles, Amerika Serikat: Palgrave MacMillan, Center for International and Development Education Graduate School of Education and Information Studies, 2010), 6.

⁴⁶A. Yakob Matondang, *Perguruan Tinggi Islam Sebagai Subjek dan Objek Moral Akademik di Era Globalisasi* (Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana, 1998), 128.

and fast. The development of information and technology is now also one of the Ministry of Religion and Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education choice in designing its policies by utilizing existing technological developments such as submitting online journal accreditation through http://arjuna.ristekdikti. go.id page, lecturer certification program in Higher Education Institutions (PTU) through the http://serdos.ristekdikti.go.id page, while lecturers who are at Islamic Higher Education through the http://serdos.diktis.id page, accreditation and institutions submission through http://sapto.banpt.or.id. This policy was issued to accelerate regulation in all fields, besides that as an objective assessment for universities to compete with other universities.

Competition between universities occurs in various forms and can occur at institutions, local, regional, national and global levels. For example, the provision of cross-border tertiary education involves competition between domestic providers, who may be public or private and foreign institutions doing business in the local environment⁴⁷ as recently emerged the mechanism for ranking universities with the various barometers used. This is a secondaryproduct of the existing competition phenomenon. College leaders make this ranking system to make decisions and to influence reforms done in college.48 This ranking encourages the college academics community in Indonesia to introspect their own achievements. What distinguishes the national level college that has been running so far with Asian regional and world class college is continuesly being discussion subject. Why are Indonesia college ratings generally low? In the past two decades, a lot of research has been conducted and books have been published to review the development of education management in college, especifically those related to phenomena known as research universities and World Class University (WCU).49

⁴⁷Portnoi, *Higher Education, Policy, and the Global Competition Phenomenon*, 7. ⁴⁸Portnoi.

⁴⁹Philip G. Altbach, *The Road to Academic Excellence: Pendirian Universitas Riset Kelas Dunia* (Jakarta: Salemba Humanika, 2012), 60

The development and achievement of World Class University (WCU) has been the discussion subject lately as well as at the level of Islamic Higher Education. Global university rankings have become "ideal" universities all ove the world. At an extreme level, WCU status and the global ranking of universities is transformed into an "academic ideology" on which various forms of idealism and academic achievement in every college are always embedded. Various policies that lead to improve the college ranking are always told for the sake of increasing rankings at the global universities level.⁵⁰

The dominant impact felt from this tendency was the formulation of the WCU blueprint in various versions which became a reference for the majority of universities in the world. As a result, each university competes to improve its university rankings to invest its budget. The impact of globalization is also very much felt in Indonesia, that the government has launched various policy packages in order to boost the quality of WCU. Among the policies we can see is the establishment of eight national education standards through Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 19 Tahun 2005 and Higher Education Long Term Strategy (HELTS) 2003-2010 as a basic reference for improving the quality of higher education.⁵¹

College quality improvement is always blocked by complicated and infinite policies. Citing Professor Al Makin's inaugural speech is "Bureaucracy and advertising in Indonesia are no longer a public secret. It is very complicated, long and very procedural and consumes a lot of energy. Administration is sometimes considered to be more essential than the core problem and knowledge".⁵² Portraits like this are not only in the elite environment, but they are increasingly

⁵⁰Masdar Hilmy, Pendidikan Islam dan Tradisi Ilmiah, 23.

⁵¹Hilmy, 24.

⁵²Al Makin, "Bisakah Menjadi Ilmuwan di Indonesia?: Keilmuan, Birokrasi, dan Globalisasi", Pidato Pengukuhan Guru Besar UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, November 8, 2018, 26.

tightening grass roots in implementing policy products. There are often multiple interpretations for the authorities in various Islamic universities. Multiple interpretations of policy products are strongly influenced by the campus socio-political climate and the authority interests in implementing policies.

The appointment and dismissal policy of Rector and Chairman of the Islamic Higher Education as in Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 68 Tahun 2015 about the appointment rules and mechanism for selecting the Rector and Chairman of the Islamic Higher Education in its implementation creates a lot of pros and cons and leaves many issues that still surround the public discussion room. The emergence of Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 68 Tahun 2015 which was originally to reduce the polarization of the campus community which during the election and change of campus leadership is often noisy and not conducive, but in the implementation of this regulation new problems arise related to cases of "buying and selling" positions that had ever occurred. In the implementation of Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 68 Tahun 2015 which creates the stigma of "buying and selling" positions in the Ministry of Religion, Commission 8 of the House of Representatives of the Republic of Indonesia (Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Republik Indonesia, DPR-RI) urged to delete Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 68 Tahun 2015 related to Rector and Chairman appointment and dismissal of the Islamic Higher Education. This policy opens up opportunities for collusion and corruption practices within Islamic Higher Education because the authority to elect Rector and Chair is entirely given to the Minister of Religion as in Article 8 in Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 68 Tahun 2015, that the determination and appointment of Rector and Chancellor is done by the Minister. This article opened up opportunities for "negotiations" and authority wars in influencing the decision to determine Rector and Chairman of Islamic Higher Education.

The implementation of college policies should involve community involvement in this case the college community to take part in translating the product of a policy.⁵³ In reality, the formulation of policies is not accompanied by socialization and asking input from various elements in college. Lecturer and staff academics are only used as objects of policy implementation from campus authorities who have authority over the policies they make.

Their actors and institutional leaders are responsible for implementing policies at the institutional or system level. Actions taken are often the result of how actors interpret and understand solutions, problems, and incentives for decision making.⁵⁴ Many colleges very diverse and dynamic in interpreting Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 into more technical regulations. Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 can be interpreted in two categories of policy changes; those are major policy changes and minor policy changes.⁵⁵

Major policy changes occurs in Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 policy is motivated by the academics anxiety who feel confined to the policies implemented by the Ministry of Religion regulation of Peraturan Direktur Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Nomor 2 Tahun 2013 concerning the discipline of lecturer attendance in Islamic Higher Education environment, which requires an instructor to fulfill working hours of 7,5 hours in one day and 37,5 hours in one week. This is considered by academics to limit lecturer; creativity and space to take part outside the campus.

Negotiations between academics and policy makers in the Ministry of Religion lasted long enough, to create the lecturer

⁵³Abdullah Fikri, "Partisipasi Politik Masyarakat Difabel dalam Pembentukan Kebijakan Pendidikan Tinggi Inklusif", *Inklusi* 1, no. 1 (2014): 109-28.

⁵⁴Tara L. Parker and Michelle Sterk Barret, *The State of Developmental Education Higher Education and Public Policy Priorities* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2014), 37.

⁵⁵Frank Fischer and Gerald J. Miller, *Analisis Kebijakan Publik: Teori, Politik, dan Metode*, transl. Imam Baihaqie (Bandung: Nuansa Media, 2013), 172.

working hour's regulations as stipulated in Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017. Negotiations here are done by arguing, information and "power" to influence attitudes in a "network of tensions".⁵⁶ The negotiation process in the context of changing lecturer working hours policy is quite tough, because this policy has at least implications for a number of things related to the college environment both in food allowances and time attendance techniques that must be renewed.

Meanwhile, minor policy changes according to Hogwood and Gunn's theory, to realize the policy product perfectly, it needs certain requirements. Those requirements are: *First*, the stability of internal conditions faced by the agency or institutions in this case the implementing college will not cause serious problem or obstacles. Problem and obstacles here can be interpreted by social conditions, and political around the college. Here the writer chooses two Islamic Higher Education which become the object of research in the implementation of Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017. Those are the State Islamic Institute of Surakarta and the State Islamic Institute of Kudus.

In socializing Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017, the State Islamic Institute of Kudus is still confused and not respond by issuing circular or technical regulations related to the mechanism of implementing this lecturer working hours. Muhammad Saekhan Mukhit as Vice Chairman 1 at that time had many considerations and reasons for not issuing derivative policies from the Peraturan Menteri Agama. One of the reasons stated was that the regulation of Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 was still global, and the campus parties could not issue technical regulations related to this. Peraturan Menteri Agama needs more regulations such as the Director of Islamic Higher Education Regulations or Government

⁵⁶Cohen, 18.

Regulations that are more detailed and technical, then universities (campuses) can issue derivative policy products.⁵⁷

The lecturers' anxiety and confusion in responding to this waket statement is when they have to fulfill the obligation of working hours and how the mechanism when there are activities outside the campus. In the writer's interview with Mualimul Huda,⁵⁸ states the obscurity of the State Islamic Institute of Kudus in responding Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017. As academics, I feel that my latitude is limited because in fact the lecturer working hours still use Peraturan Direktur Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Nomor 2 Tahun 2013, which requires a lecturer to enter full like an employee without any exceptions.⁵⁹

In contrast to the State Islamic Institute of Surakarta, the attitude taken in implementing Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 does not have to wait for technical derivations from other regulations. The firm attitude taken by the State Islamic Institute of Surakarta is by releasing a Surat Edaran Tentang Jam Kerja Dosen No.: B-1593/In.10/R/KP.00/05/2017. There are four points of the circular letter as the technique policy in implementing Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017, such as: *First*, lecturers are required to do the College of Tri Darma (Tri Dharma Perguruan Tinggi) according to the applicable laws. *Second*, the provisions on the number of hours that must be fulfilled in teaching and mentoring activities are adjusted to Peraturan Menteri Agama Tentang Jam Kerja Dosen are required to fill in the attendance list electronically. *Fourth*, lecturers are entitled

⁵⁷Statement of Vice Chairman 1, Muhammad Saekhan Mukhit, in interpreting and socialize Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017, at that time IAIN Kudus was still STAIN Kudus.

⁵⁸Permanent Lecturer of the State Islamic Institute of Kudus.

⁵⁹Interview result with Mualimul Huda, one of permanent-lecturer at the State Islamic Institute of Kudus, on January 15, 2019.

to get leave the same as the applicable policy to the State Civil Apparatus (Pegawai Negeri Sipil, PNS), with the requirements that the implementation of lecturer leave done during semester breaks and does not interfere the implementation of educational services or the lecture process.

The implementation of this policy directly has a positive impact on lecturers at the State Islamic Institute of Surakarta. Muhammad Rifqi, one of the State Islamic Institute of Surakarta permanent-lecturers, said that the policy related to lecturers working hours gave lecturers the opportunity to take part and conduct research and service outside the campus without complicated attendance.⁶⁰ In Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017, the obligation as a lecturer with the lowest position Expert Assistant (Asisten Ahli) is required to fill lecturer hours of work 21 hours/week, lecturers with Lecturer (Lektor) positions of 17 hours/week, lecturers with servants Head Lectors (Lektor Kepala) are required to attend and fill attendance electronically 12 hours/week, while the lecturer has a Mandatory Teacher (Guru Besar) position within a week of 9 hours/week.

In implementing the Hogwood and Gunn policy products, it needs reliable time and resources. This second requirement can at least be used as a tool to interpret why the State Islamic Institute of Kudus in this regard seems slow in implementing Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017. From the writer's observations at least find an answer, that the political climate of the State Islamic Institute of Kudus campus at the time of this Peraturan Menteri Agama release was less conducive.⁶¹ Besides the unfavorable climate of the campus "politics", the State Islamic Institute of Kudus's

⁶⁰Interview with Muhammad Rifqi, one of permanent-lecturer at the State Islamic Institute of Surakarta, on June 20, 2019.

⁶¹The social situation of the State Islamic Institute of Kudus campus in 2017 is very worrying; the quite dramatic struggle for leadership (Rector election) has made academics split into two large camps between incumbents and political opponents.

human resources are still very limited. This is also one of the main reasons for campus authorities not to respond in Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017.

As time goes by and the emergence of unrest among the State Islamic Institute of Kudus lecturers, the leadership of the State Islamic Institute of Kudus just responds this matter. As a consequence, the leadership releases an internal policy related to lecturers working hours through Surat Edaran Nomor 13 Tahun 2019 about the absence hours for lecturers and staffs within the State Islamic Institute of Kudus which contains:

a. Working hours for lecturers and staffs in the State Islamic Institute of Kudus are:

- M onday-Thrusday	: 07.30 AM-04.00 PM
	(break: 12.00 PM-13.00 PM)
- Friday	: 07.30 AM-04.00 PM
	(break: 11.30 AM-13.00 PM)

- b. The arrival hours calculated by the attendance system are at least at 06.00 AM;
- c. The return hours calculated by the attendance system are the maximum at 17.30 PM;
- d. For lecturers or staffs who for some reason do not do attendance according must make a permit that must be known by the direct supervisor;
- e. For lecturers or staffs who do overtime, it is required to do attendance according to the specified hours and make a statement of overtime hours signed by the direct.

Referring to this policy related to lecturer working hours is equated with other administrative staffs without any fundamental differences. Another odd thing about this policy is the legal basis used in releasing this Surat Edaran is: Undang-undang Nomor 12 Tahun 2012, Undang-undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2014, Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 53 Tahun 2010, Peraturan Presiden Nomor 27 Tahun 2018, Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 33 Tahun 2018,

Muhammad Miftah

Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 1 tahun 2019. Policy makers do not consider the existence of Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 5 Tahun 2017. This is risky if they make a policy without looking at the core policy that becomes the patron for more technical policies.

In addition the legal basis used in making this Surat Edaran as an internal policy product, there are irrelevant contents of this Surat Edaran including: Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 33 Tahun 2018 and Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 1 tahun 2019. As long as the research is conducted from various research sources the writer has not found a legal basis written as a basis for releasing Surat Edaran about lecturer working hours by the State Islamic Institute of Kudus. This policy directly limits lecturers and researchers at the State Islamic Institute of Kudus to do activities outside college.

The Ministry of Religion hopes to have world-class college and realize demographic bonuses and get out of the trap of middle-income countries, occurs when human relations within the community campus become very harmonious and dynamic.⁶² Objectives like this can be realized in many ways, one of the most effective things is to encourage academics to be creative and provide the widest possible space to optimize their potential without ignoring the obligations they carry. This can be realized with a humanist and non-discriminatory policy product.

C. Conclusion

Policy products in the development of Islamic Higher Education are still overshadowed by two major authorities who are always involved in Islamic Higher Education entities, namely the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education (now the Ministry of Education and Culture) and the Ministry of Religion. Islamic Higher Education is still hesitant to position itself between

⁶²Michael Barber, Katelyn Donnelly, and Saad Rizvi, "An Avalanche Is Coming: Higher Education and the Revolution Ahead", *Voprosy Obrazovaniya/Educational Studies* 3, no. 1 (2013): 152-229.

two authorities who have the authority to manage Islamic Higher Education. Another problem obstructing the progress of Islamic Higher Education is the translation of existing policies into more detailed rules. Also a problem, the policies released by the Ministry of Religion and the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education were not socialized and implemented due to political and social considerations surrounding them in various Islamic colleges.

The autonomy given to Islamic Higher Education in translating policies released by the Ministry of Religion does provide opportunities for college to develop their local. But on the other hand the translation of existing policies is often at opposite with the policy itself. There are a number of underlying factors including social conditions, campus politics, interests and leader of authority who lead a university, triggering multiple interpretations of a policy product.

Policy interpretation in college is very dynamics. Each college has its own differences and characteristics. This happens because of the emergence of goals interpretation, targets and strategies in translating existing policies. This is called the implementation gap, that is in the world of policy what will be expected to emerge with the reality that results from existing policy products.

In this case what needs to be considered in minimizing the implementation gap that occurs in Islamic Higher Education is to optimize the role of the Internal Supervisory Unit (Satuan Pengawas Internal, SPI) and Higher Education Quality Assurance Institution (Lembaga Penjaminan Mutu, LPM) in implementing existing policy products and translated into more detailed rules as policy products released by the college as a more technical policy, derived from policies issued by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education and the Ministry of Religion.

REFERENCES

- Abbas, Syahrizal. *Managemen Perguruan Tinggi*. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group, 2009.
- Abdul Wahab, Solichin. Analisis KebijaksanaaN: dari Formulasi ke Implementasi Kebijaksanaan Negara. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 1997.
- Agung, Iskandar, and Agus Santoso. "Dinamika LPTK Menuju Perguruan Tinggi Kelas Dunia (World Class University/ WCU)", *Perspektif Ilmu Pendidikan* 31, no. 1 (2017): 42–54.
- Al Makin. "Bisakah Menjadi Ilmuwan di Indonesia?: Keilmuan, Birokrasi, dan Globalisasi", Pidato Pengukuhan Guru Besar UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, November 8, 2018.
- Ali, Mukti. Beberapa Masalah Pendidikan di Indonesia. Yogyakarta: Yayasan Nida, 1971.
- Ali, St. Hasniyati Gani. "Kebijakan Pemerintah terhadap Pembinaan Pendidikan Islam", *Al-Ta'dib* 8, no. 2 (2015): 99–110.
- Altbach, Philip G. The Road to Academic Excellence: Pendirian Universitas Riset Kelas Dunia. Jakarta: Salemba Humanika, 2012.
- Amirudin, "Dinamika Lembaga Pendidikan Tinggi di Indonesia", Jurnal MIQOT 41, no. 1 (2017): 98–117.
- Anwar, Mohammad Emnis. "Menelusuri Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam di Indonesia", *Edukasi Islami: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 5 (2017).
- Asy'ari, Musa. *Menggagas Revolusi Kebudayaan Tanpa Kekerasan*. Yogyakarta: LESFI, 2003.
- Aziz, Abdul. "Memperkuat Kebijakan Negara dalam Penanggulangan Radikalisme di Lembaga Pendidikan", *Hikmah Journal of Islamic Studies* 12, no. 1 (2016): 29–58.
- Azra, Azyumardi. "Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam di Era Otonomi Daerah", *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan* 2, no. 2 (2017).

- Bappenas. Laporan Kajian Pendanaan Pendidikan Tinggi di Indonesia. Jakarta: Bappenas, 2010.
- Barber, Michael, Katelyn Donnelly, and Saad Rizvi. "An Avalanche Is Coming: Higher Education and the Revolution Ahead", *Voprosy Obrazovaniya/Educational Studies* 3, no. 1 (2013): 152– 229.
- Baudet, and Brugmans. *Politik Etis dan Revolusi Kemerdekaan*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia, 1987.
- Carey, Kevin, and Mark Schneider. *Accountability in American Higher Education*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010.
- Cohen, Herb. You Can Negotiate Anything. New York: Arrangement with Lyle Stuart, 1980.
- Creswell, John W. Research Design: Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2010.
- Fathurrohman, Muhammad, and Sulitiorini. *Implementasi Manajemen Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Islam.* Yogyakarta: Teras, 2012.
- Fikri, Abdullah. "Partisipasi Politik Masyarakat Difabel dalam Pembentukan Kebijakan Pendidikan Tinggi Inklusif", *INKLUSI* 1, no. 1 (2014): 109–28.
- Foucault, Michel. *Discipline and Punish: the Birth of the Prison*, trans. A. Sheridan. Harmonsworth: Peregrine, 1977.
 - _____. Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977, ed. C. Gordon. Bringhton: Harvester, 1980.
- Gardiner, Mayling Oey. Era Disrupsi: Peluang dan Tantangan Pendidikan Tinggi Indonesia. Jakarta: Akademi Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia, 2017.
- Hardiman, F. Budi. Filsafat Modern. Jakarta: Gramedia, 2007.
- Hasan, Ibnu. "Meninjau Ulang Kebijakan Pemerintah Bidang Pendidikan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam", *Journal Islamdina* 17, no. 2 (2016): 1–20.

- Hefni, Wildani. "Kebijakan Politik dalam Pengembangan Tradisi Akademik Intelektual Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam", *Akademika: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 23, no. 1 (2018): 107–28.
- Hilmy, Masdar. Pendidikan Islam dan Tradisi Ilmiah. Malang: Madani, 2016.
- Hogwood, B.W, and L.A. Gunn. *Policy Analysis for the Real World*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1984.
- Irianto, Sulistiowati. Otonomi Perguruan Tinggi: Suatu Keniscayaan. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia, 2012.
- Khon, Koh Aik. "Hallmark of a Worl-Class University", College Student Journal, 2005.
- Mahfud, Choirul. Politik Pendidikan Islam: Analisis Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam Pasca Orde Baru. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2016.
- Masdin. "Konsep Dasar Analisis Kebijakan Pendidikan Tinggi", *Shautut Tarbiyah* 21, no. 1 (2009): 83–101.
- Matondang, A. Yakob. Perguruan Tinggi Islam Sebagai Subjek dan Objek Moral Akademik di Era Globalisasi. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana, 1998.
- Miles, Mateew B., A.M. Huberman, and Johny Saldana. *Qualitative Data Analysis: a Methods Sourcebook.* Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publication, Inc., 2014.
- Moko, Haryatmoko. *Etika Politik dan Kekuasaan*. Jakarta: Kompas, 2003.
- Munadi, Muhammad, Fetty Ernawati, and Hakiman Hakiman. "The Reality of Knowledge Management in Islamic Higher Education", *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 7, no. 2 (2018): 225–37.
- Muzammil, As'ad. "Kebijakan Pemerintah dalam Bidang Pendidikan: dari Orde Lama sampai Orde Baru (Suatu Tinjauan Historis)", *Potensia* 2, no. 2 (2016): 183–98. S.,
- Nasution, S. Metode Penelitian Naturalistik. Bandung: Tarsito, 1998.
- Nazir, Mohammad. Metode Penelitian. Jakarta: Erlangga, 1999.

- Parker, Tara L., and Michelle Sterk Barret. *The State of Developmental Education Higher Education and Public Policy Priorities.* New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2014.
- Pomalingo, Samsi. "Perguruan Tinggi dan Transformasi Nilai-nilai Islam dalam Konteks Sosial-Budaya Masyarakat Indonesia", *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun* 2, no. 3 (2014): 119–34.
- Portnoi, Laura M. Higher Education, Policy, and the Global Competition Phenomenon. Los Angeles Amerika Serikat: Palgrave MacMillan, Center for International and Development Education Graduate School of Education&Information Studies, 2010.
- Putra, Galih R.N. Politik Pendidikan: Liberalisasi Pendidikan Tinggi di Indonesia dan India. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia, 2016.
- Ritzer, George, and Douglas J. Goodman. Teori Sosisologi: dari Sosiologi Klasik sampai Perkembangan Mutakhir Teori Sosial Postmodern. Yogyakarta: Keasi Wacana, 2010.
- Saifullah. "Reformulasi Paradigma Kajian Keislaman di Perguruan Tinggi Agama Islam (PTAI)", *Edukasia: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama dan Keagamaan* 10, no. 2 (2012).
- Shaleh, Abdul Rohman. *Madrasah dan Pendidikan Anak Bangsa.* Jakarta: Raja Grafindo, 2004.
- Suryadi, Aceh. *Analisis Kebijakan Pendidikan: Sebuah Pengantar.* Bandung: Rosdakarya, 1994.
- Sutrisno. Pembaharuan Pengembangan Pendidikan Islam. Yogyakarta: Fadilatama, 2011.

Tanzeh, Ahmad. Pengantar Metode Penelitian. Yogyakarta: Teras, 2009.

- Tilaar, H.A.R, and Riant Nugroho. *Kebijakan Pendidikan*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2012.
- Wahidmurni. Penguatan Kelembagaan Menuju Destinasi Utama. Malang: UIN Maliki Press, 2014.

- Wahyono, Andi. "Kebijakan Pendidikan Islam: Hibridasi Lembaga Pendidikan Tinggi", *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 1 (2014): 115–34.
- Widodo, Joko. Analisis Kebijakan Publik: Konsep dan Aplikasi Analisis Proses Kebijakan Publik. Malang: Bayumedia, 2009.
- Wit, Hans de, and Tony Adams. *Policies, Rationales, and Practices in Australia and Europe.* New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010.
- Zurqoni. Meretas Peran Perguruan Tinggi: Refleksi atas Idealitas Penyelenggaraan Pendidikan Tinggi Islam. Yogyakarta: ar-Ruzz Media, 2013.